Bayview Hunters Point Environmental Justice Response Task Force

Part of the IVAN Network * Identifying Violations Affecting Neighborhoods

Community Meeting, Thursday, July 19, 2018 6:00 PM- 8:00 PM, Dinner 5:30 PM
Southeast Community Facility (Alex Pitcher Room) 1800 Oakdale, Bayview Hunters Point, San Francisco

Meeting Minutes

● 6:00PM Welcome
● 6:10PM Review of New Pollution Complaints
  ○ One of the primary purposes of the IVAN network: establish a safe space for submitting pollution complaints that would not compromise anyone’s living situations
  ○ Two IVAN complaints made yesterday 7/19.
    1) Manure smell outside city college building.
    2) Dumping trash-toys left on sidewalk.
● 6:15PM (CANCELED) Presentation by Tashaun Holloway, Youth Outreach Worker for Greenaction's Bayview Hunters Point Diesel Education and Emissions Reduction Project
● 6:20PM Community Pollution Mapping Project update by BVHP Youth Mapping Team
  ○ 1st step in air monitoring program: collaboration with Literacy for Environmental Justice, Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice, Grafiki.
  ○ They are mapping places with heavy pollution which will determine the placement of air monitors
  ○ BVHP Community Air Study by Evah, Erin, Kalo, Yader, Sam, Dalvin, Anthony, and Demarion
    ■ Purpose: To develop and gain an in-depth understanding of air pollution in BVHP; create maps to get more attention on the subject
    ■ Methodology: walked around BVHP, and observed pollution sources such as abandoned cars and trash
    ■ Results: Streets not properly mapped; buildings missing hazard signs; improper methods of waste cleanup.
    ■ What they learned: Pollution sources and sensitive receptors. An example of a pollution source is an auto body shop in middle of neighborhood. An example of a sensitive receptor is a school or old folks’ home
      Life expectancy in BVHP is 15 years shorter than national average
    ■ Their concerns: Sensitive receptors are close to the pollution source; unknown activity in unmarked buildings.
    ■ For the future: We hope to see more funding to continue this project, specifically younger age groups; talk to local businesses about importance of proper signage, ensure government agencies are held accountable for proper clean up
6:55PM SF Public Utilities Commission Update on Biosolids Digester Facilities Project, Sewer System Improvement Program and Environmental Justice Analysis
  ○ Southeast facility handles 80% of city’s sewage.
  ○ Overview of sewer system- combined sewer system (collects and treats both sewage and storm water)
  ○ Major challenges they struggle with: sewer systems built in late 1800s/ early 1900s; working with outdated facilities/ equipment which contributes to the smell; challenges of climate change and sea level rise and also seismic activity
  ○ 20-year program- sewer system improvement program; implementing grey (system reliability), green (stormwater management), and clean (environmentally friendly) infrastructure
  ○ Sewer System Improvement Program (SSIP) Phase 1- top priority of agency is the Southeast Treatment facility
  ○ Biosolids Digester Facility Project- building brand new facilities creates blank slate - odor control, seismic vulnerability, energy recovery; addresses problem of odors in this community; New footprint- able to incorporate new technology, reduce number of digesters from 9-5, capture more of biogas digester, improving biosolid treatment quality to Class A.
  ○ Odor control is critical element of facility- implementation of project to start early 2019
  ○ EJ analysis is a groundbreaking document; makes room for additional observations and concerns; looks at effects of construction of this project and also BVHP area as a whole
    ■ Purpose- measure how project would impact BVHP; took into account 62 different indicators (i.e. minority status, rent burden, environmental burden, groundwater contamination, air quality, ozone concentrations)
    ■ Out of the 62 indicators, 33 of these were disproportionately affecting BVHP in comparison to rest of SF/ California.
    ■ Goals to plant trees, language accessibility- signs in Spanish and Chinese.
    ■ Community benefits and recommendations from EJ policy- accessible electric cars, create paid internships for young people in BVHP.

7:15PM State Department of Toxic Substances Control Update on DTSC’s work on the Shipyard Superfund Site
  ○ DTSC: Study shows that highest source of cancer is diesel particulates.
  ○ Hunters Point- 500 acres above ground, purchased by Navy-land used to repair ships until around 1976
    ■ 1989- Hunters Point was put on National Priority List.
    ■ With the EPA, our department oversees the Shipyard cleanup
    ■ Each parcel is evaluated to determine its land use
    ■ There are two issues to discuss tonight- 1) Falsification of data by Tetra Tech who was contracted by the Navy 2) Restesting of the Shipyard
    ■ Last month- Navy released work plan to be done with Parcel A for a full clean up
    ■ DTSC wants to be confident in remediation plan before implementation
    ■ Parcel A was transferred to city because it was deemed safe, but because of Tetra Tech’s falsification, all parcels are suspect
In Parcel A, DTSC plans to post scan results and data to be shared with the community regularly.

**QUESTIONS for DTSC:**

- Participant: You are first DTSC to actually show up here. We need DTSC project staff to be at the Task Force meetings every month.
- Participant: Are you concerned that scanning will not detect anything?
  - DTSC: Instruments that they are using are state of the art gamma ray detection. Yes, they only go 6 inches, but if there is radiation and it is not detected with these scanners, then it is not reaching the surface and therefore exposure is prevented.
- Participant: This land has been contaminated for a long time. How can we trust anything they say? Everything needs to be redone. They might as well not even do 6 inches, all we would get in 6 inches is what they [Tetra Tech] put down. What is more important the building, the money or the peoples’ lives? People's’ lives are more valuable than these buildings.
- Participant: What is the main contaminant in the shipyard?
  - DTSC: Radioactive material and lead (due to age of buildings). Organics, solvents and chemicals that they use in industry to clean, degrease etc.
- Participant: I worked in the Shipyard at the testing site as a welder- we would weld and blow up all kinds of things. There was so much waste. It is impossible to clean it all up. The community needs to know how they are being affected. I don’t trust air monitors. A lot of my friends who worked in shipyard are dead, we are like the canaries. Last thing- we need more outreach, so people know what’s going on.
- Participant: What we are dealing with in the shipyard is a cumulative issue. You need to go deep in the ground. Houses are built on contaminated land. We do not want anything just surface-level.

**QUESTIONS FOR PUC:**

- Participant: When they built this building, community interests were guaranteed. 50% community employment guaranteed. Any expansion done- community was given money. Young people don’t know that history of toxic things here- i.e. PG&E, but they can educate the younger generations. They did testing for Hiroshima and Nagasaki in shipyard at the experimental lab. His mother got double breast cancer from shipyard.
- Participant: This is living history. This gentleman’s family was first Black family to buy home here.
- Participant: When you come back to this community [PUC], bring information, bring literature because there’s a lot of this we may forget when we get home.
- Participant: When this facility was built, and the during the expansion of the sewage plant, there was a benefits plan that was agreed to. Those agreements were never kept. PUC, your footprint is growing, so new community benefits are required, you cannot substitute. This building belongs to us. You need to address the previous benefits package, which was not kept, in addition to new promises. Otherwise, PUC is lying to us and cheating us. If they shut down this sewage plant, it
would be the next Superfund Site. The chemicals that they are using to treat our water are harmful. When PUC says these are the benefits, they are shortchanging us.

- 7:25PM Golden Gate University School of Law Environmental Law and Justice Clinic Update on Petition to Revoke Tetra Tech's License
  - Speaker: We represented Greenaction in a series of actions that involved the Shipyard. I want to talk about parcel A and G. Greenaction filed petition with Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) in June 2017 which has been pending for over a year now. We received whistleblower statements from former employees. Between then and now, we have obtained additional data which proves fraud was even worse than we initially believed. Fortunately, we received a call from NRC who agreed to accept our case. There will be a hearing in Maryland and a transcript will be available to everyone. We can either show up in person and get an hour, or discuss over the phone and get 30 minutes. Tetra Tech will actually be there.
  - Next, Parcel A- we brought the whistleblower forward who actually tested Parcel A’s sewer system and both came back with elevated levels of radiation. Levels were not high in themselves to create health hazards but high enough where they should have been further tested.
  - The Public Health Department missed the entire point of our comments and information we provided them. When the Navy says they plan to retest everything that is not true. They plan to test one third of the area and only the surface. We will make sure they will do what they told the public they would do - retest everything.
  - Future activities- we will do everything we can on behalf of Greenaction and the community to hold everyone accountable and make sure there is significant improvement in the cleanup.

- 7:35PM Upcoming Environmental Justice Tour for state, regional, local, federal government agency officials
  - Participant: Greenaction and West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project are organizing toxic tours across the state, and is coming to BVHP. Proposal: BVHP toxic tour October 17. We would like government agencies and communities, federal, state, county, city officials to get in on a bus and do training and a tour. There would be a 2pm meeting with a crowd of government agencies.
  - Participant: Thank you for opening up this conversation, this will be an opportunity to magnify community voices

- 7:40PM Proposal to Host the Participants at the October 17th Task Force meeting at 2 pm
- 7:45 Public Comment / Next Steps
  - Participant: PUC, you are going to capture methane and use it to power the new plant?
    o PUC: yes.
  - Participant: (For PUC) We took 30 years to shut down PG&E’s methane power plants. Why would you bring that back?
    o PUC: No comment
(For DTSC)  In radioactive/ nuclear sciences you call an element, a species. You need to know specific radioactive elements [on the Shipyard] in order to test/cleanup properly. The cleanup of organics and mineral toxics do not fall under CA Department of Public Health jurisdiction. Most attention has been on radioactivity, but there are other toxic materials that can get people sick, which are not being addressed.

- DTSC: No comment.

- Participant: The Navy repeatedly told community that there was no radioactive contamination. The Navy said they were not going to test parcel A-1 because it is residential, so there had not been any activity which would have threatened the land. I do not feel comfortable with the claim that we don’t need to go back and do in-depth testing because it’s [the parcel] is residential. That’s not sufficient. We can’t feel that you [PUC] are protecting us.

- 8pm: Meeting Adjourned

NEXT TASK FORCE MEETING: AUGUST 15TH 2-4PM at Southeast Community Facility