Bayview Hunters Point Environmental Justice Response Task Force

Part of the IVAN (Identifying Violations Affecting Neighborhoods) Network: www.bvhp-ivan.org

When: Wednesday, January 20, 2020
Time: 2:00 p.m.- 4:00 p.m.
Location: https://us02web.zoom.us/j/83031643940
Meeting ID: 830 3164 3940
Call in: +1 408 638 0968 US (San Jose)

Participants: Dalila Adofo (Greenaction), Suna Bayrakal (Product Stewardship Institute), Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD (Golden State MD), Bradley Angel (Greenaction), Judy Rosenfeld (1000 Grandmothers), Cole Burchiel (San Francisco Baykeeper), Chalam Tubati (BVHP Resident), Dr. Blair Lapin (BVHP Resident, Extinction Rebellion and Greenaction Volunteer), Chris Whipple (Bayview Hill Neighborhood Association & Southeast Community Council), Joan (1000 Grandmothers), Eric Bissinger (CARB Enforcement), Morgan Capilla (Environmental Protection Agency), Sabrina Hall (BVHP Resident, Greenaction, BVHP Mothers and Fathers Committee), Peter Nguyen (UC Davis), Abraham Zhan (Department of Toxic Substances Control), Alexander Velasco (Literacy for Environmental Justice), Edgar Barraza (SF Public Utilities Commission), Sraddha Mehta (San Francisco Department of the Environment), R. Manion (San Francisco Department of the Environment), Azibuike Akaba, Joshua Abraham (Bay Area Air Quality Management District - BAAQMD), Renay Jenkins (BVHP Resident), Leaotis Martin (BVHP Resident), Johnny Martin (BVHP Resident), Brendan Adamczyk (Product Stewardship Institute), Mishwa Lee, Jackie Barshak (Extinction Rebellion), Rebecca E. Skinner, Sara Greenwald (350 San Francisco), Lea Yamashiro (Greenaction), Zsea Bowmani (NLG/Greenaction)

AGENDA

2:00 PM Welcome
2:10 PM Community Announcements and Resources exchange
2:25 PM IVAN Complaints
2:40 PM Baykeeper Introduction by Cole Burchiel
2:50 PM “Safe Management of Mercury Lights: Minimizing the Risk of Exposure” by Suna Bayrakal (Product of Stewardship Institute) and Bradley Angel (Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice)
3:25 PM Next Meeting Date and Time
3:30 PM Meeting Adjourned
Dalila: Welcome, everyone. If anyone wants to make any announcements, now is the time.

Bradley: There is a hearing about a massive development project in the Bayview Hunters Point – hearing is at 1:00 p.m. Can go to the BCDC website for info.

- The concern is that the environmental impact report said that there would be significant and permanent air pollution.
- Encourage everyone who is interested can contact us for the information, additionally if people are interested in testifying.

Renay: FYI, Muni is making big changes – routes when driving and walking. The 15 is coming back. Keep eyes open for any complaint issues so that we can file them on IVAN website.

Dalila Adofo:

- We want to review the calendar
- Sent it out in the notice from the other day, let her know if you did not receive the notice (have been having some technical issues with emails)
- 2021 Calendar
  - These meeting remain virtual until further notice
  - Bay Area still has shelter-in-place orders
  - Hopefully we can come back together some time, but this is the time schedule.
  - We are moving up the evening EJ Task Force to 6-7
- Now moving into the one complaint that was filed between November and now.
- 1305 Wallace Avenue, solid waste – potentially hazardous illegally dumped material along the shore.
- There has been a downturn in reports through IVAN – it’s really important to encourage people to make reports.

Renay:

- Has been experiencing tech difficulties with IVAN, so maybe there are some technological difficulties occurring we don’t know about.
- Aunt’s hair salon has a sewer issue – it is backed up, draining down the street where people are walking. It has been there for 3 or 4 days. Residents need to know who to complain to and we need to make it as easy as possible for them to file the complaints.

Morgan:

- We received the complaint about the illegal dumping near the Yosemite Slough.
- She checked in with the city and is waiting to hear back from them, and as soon as she hears back, she will forward that information to Greenaction staff.

Dalila: With that, Cole go ahead and introduce yourself!

Cole Burchiel:

- Recently got in contact with Dalila and Bradley about involvement between organization and participation in the Bayview Hunters Point stuff.
- Field Investigator and science associate with San Francisco Baykeeper
  - BAYKEEPER:
    - Organization that monitors the bay
- 7.7 million people
- 86 city systems
- 5 oil refineries
- 42 sewage plants
- 380 vessels and tankers
- 1640 active industrial facilities
- Over 1000 abandoned toxic sites (and counting)
- Anticipated 7 feet of sea level rise in next 100 years

Baykeeper’s mission is to identify and protect the Bay and its community from its biggest threats and hold polluters accountable.

Who is Baykeeper?
- Attorneys, scientists and advocacy specialists who work together to ensure that these threats are being identified. Here’s how:
  - 1. Investigation
    - With drones, looking for sources of pollution
  - 2. Legislation
    - Attorneys working hard to enact stronger protections for water resources and usage
  - 3. Litigation
    - Within the Clean Water Act (citizens’ suit)
    - When facilities are not cleaning up their act, they make sure they do under this act
  - 4. Community Partnerships

Investigating Pollution
- Pollution Hotline:
  - Get many complaints about major environmental violations happening around the bay, like oil spills
  - When they receive these notifications, they have the ability to go investigate (with boat, drone, ground and airplane)
  - Since 1989, 15000 hours investigating pollution issues

Strengthening Environmental Laws
- First farm runoff law in the country (Baykeeper helped draft) that helps limit the amount of nutrients that make way into the water supply in the Bay
- Working on a Zero Trash Policy
- Mercury Cleanup Plan (identifying toxic sites and mitigating the effects and possible harm)
- Advocating for healthy practices throughout California, as Bay Area water policy ends up being the overarching policy for the rest of California

Litigation!
- Sometimes investigation does not do the job
- Over 30 years, have reviewed over 1600 polluting facilities
  - Industrial facilities
  - Waste management districts
  - Cities
  - Ports
- 277+ legal victories over 30 years
- Cleaning up facilities and areas that protect fish, wildlife and people

Community Partnerships
- Identify vulnerable communities
Those whose voices are not being heard
- Those communities that are being exploited
- Listen to the residents and local experts
- Support them, amplify their voices
- Collaborate on innovative and restorative solutions for these areas

Reporting Pollution:
- Residents can report pollution issues at:
  ** 1-800-KEEP-BAY **

  or email hotline@baykeeper.org

- Website: baykeeper.org (also a place to submit complaints)

Baykeeper Presentation given by Cole Burchiel:
Dalila: There’s time for a few questions, if anyone wants to ask Cole something about Baykeeper.

Ahimsa: About the ships that are docked at Hunters Point - every day there are 6-8 massive container ships parked there. Wondering - what is happening with all of their solid waste? Sometimes hear their engines running all through the night. How is that monitored? Does the Baykeeper do any monitoring of the ships and what happens to their waste?
Cole: Baykeeper has been keeping an eye on the ships for a while; as for the solid waste, they are contracted with agencies that dispose of the waste properly. Anything that they are putting into the Bay should be previously Bay water… As for the engine issue, we are worried about that as well, but this is a little bit out of the jurisdiction of Baykeeper, Bay Area Air Quality Management District might be better to address this.

Joshua (BAAQMD): The engines are not monitored, unfortunately. Ability to track that type of emission is hard from the distance of where the monitor is set up. But, we can respond to residents who report concerns about elongated plumes from the ships. We have a limited response – a time lag that is too long from a complaint call and the time an inspector can arrive, which increases the likelihood that nothing occurs from a regulatory standpoint. In terms of real-time monitoring, perhaps there can be pressure for the district to enforce monitoring. There have been stationary sources that have been tracked and surveilled in this way before, so there is precedent.

Links shared in Zoom chat to information on how idling ships are handled in the Bay:

- [https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/ocean-going-vessels-berth-regulation](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/ocean-going-vessels-berth-regulation)
- [https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2020-08/External%20At-Berth%20Fact%20Sheet%20August%202020%20ADA_0.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2020-08/External%20At-Berth%20Fact%20Sheet%20August%202020%20ADA_0.pdf)

Renay: You guys don’t use drones?

Joshua: So, we are admiring Baykeeper’s use of drones, because it is such a useful tool. I am following up on us being able to use drones, as this would be so helpful for the work we do.

Renay: Maybe we can put some sort of drone in the Bayview?

Leaotis: Who would be monitoring the drones?

Joshua: I understand that there is a limited capacity in terms of trust as to who would be monitoring and using the drones.

Leaotis: It’s worth noting that this would pose a privacy issue.

Joshua: There are legal ramifications for having a drone flying over a facility and other provisions that are dealt with in the process of getting a drone. Sometimes you need the legal view and legal lens to back things up.

Cole: Specifically for drone work in the Bayview Hunters Point, it is close enough to the airport that it poses certain restrictions and issues. That being said, Baykeeper wants to help with these issues, and if need to lend assistance with drones, they are willing.

Leaotis: Even if someone is certified to fly a drone, there should also be some sort of resident or someone standing with them.

Joshua: There have been requests for the operator of the drone to be accompanied by a community member.

[End Baykeeper San Francisco Presentation & Discussion]

Bradley: Thanks to everyone for helping to keep the task force going. So, a big problem facing BVHP is illegal dumping:

- Some is trash
- Some is toxic

In addition to protecting communities like Bayview, the other context for this is that these things often end up in incinerators. (Incinerators cannot destroy anything with mercury.)

**Suna Bayrackal**: Here to talk about safe mercury lamps disposal

- From Product Stewardship Institute
- Starting with a few questions:
  - 1. How must mercury lights be managed at the end of life in California? Can they be disposed of in the trash?
- Product Stewardship Institute
  - Mission: reduce the health + environmental impacts of products across their lifecycle
  - How we accomplish it: work to advance EPR laws that include manufacturer responsibility for post-consumer management of their products.
  - Product Categories: various
- What is the project about?
  - It is trying to raise awareness about the dangers of mercury lights
  - Increase the number of lights safely recycled
  - Reduce the health threats posed by mismanaged lights
- How?
  - Educational flyers for residents and businesses
  - Educational worker safety poster
  - How-to guide to advance safe lights recycling
  - Webinar on safe lights management
- Why important?
  - Over 8000 tons of residential commercial lights are disposed in CA (2014)
  - Affects low-income tenants
- Health Risks
  - Mercury can have serious heart, brain, immune and nervous system impacts
  - Drinking water limit
- Other reasons to recycle lights
  - Recover valuable materials like glass and aluminum to make other products
  - Create recycling jobs
  - Reduce the need for virgin materials to be extracted
- Types of Lights
  - Fluorescent bulbs
  - High intensity discharge HID
  - short-arc/ultraviolet
  - LED lights:
    - Don’t contain mercury, BUT:
      - They do contain heavy metals like lead, copper and more
- Mercury Lights Recycling in CA
  - Must be recycled or disposed as hazardous waste
  - Cannot be disposed in household trash, commercial solid waste or landfills
- Best management practices
  - If a light breaks at home, strategies
    - Ventilate the home
    - Turn off AC
- Young children and pregnant women should leave
- Wear a dust mask
- Remove large pieces

- Outreach Materials
  - Resident flyers
  - Informative flyers about why to recycle

- SF Environment Lights Management Resources has many guides on how to dispose of different types of lights

- Additional resources
  - Dept of toxic substances control
  - Calrecycle
  - US EPA
  - Product Stewardship Institute

- How You Can Help
  - Posting educational materials to organization’s website
  - Distribute information on social media
  - Share fact sheets with other interested parties

Can reach Suna: suna@productstewardship.us

Suna’s Presentation slides:
Recycle, Don’t Dump or Incinerate!

- Incineration is not a safe technology and emits harmful toxic pollutants into the air.
- Incineration cannot destroy the mercury in these lamps, and the mercury will end up in the air and ash.
- California’s two municipal waste (garbage) incinerators are both located in low-income/working class communities of color (Long Beach in southern California, and Crow’s Landing in Stanislaus County).

Product Stewardship Institute

National Non-profit
Building the capacity for product stewardship and extended producer responsibility (EPR) in the U.S. for 20 years

Members from 47 state gov’t agencies hundreds of local gov’ts

> 100 Partners representing producers, recyclers, waste management, retailers, NGOs, academics, international gov’ts

Product Categories

- Solar Panels
- Mattresses
- Pharmaceuticals
- Medical Sharps
- Electronics
- Packaging
- Batteries
- Thermostats
- Textiles
- HHW
- Phone Books
- Fluorescent Lamps

What is the Project About?

What?
- Raise awareness of the dangers of mercury lights + safe management
- Increase the number of lights safely recycled
- Reduce health threats posed by mismanaged lights

How?
- Educational flyers for residents and businesses
- Educational worker safety poster
- How-To Guide to Advance Safe Lights Recycling
- Webinar on safe lights management

Product Stewardship Institute

Our Mission
Reduce the health + environmental impacts of products across their lifecycle

How we accomplish it:
Work to advance EPR laws that include manufacturer responsibility for post-consumer management of their products by:
- Shifting financial and management responsibility, with government oversight, to manufacturers
- Providing incentives to manufacturers to incorporate environmental considerations into product design

Product Categories

- Appliances w/ Refrigerants
- Framework
- Tires
- Gas Cylinders
- Carpet
- Radioactive Devices
- Pesticides
- Auto Switches
- Paint
- Used Motor Oil

Why is This Important?

CA laws prohibit trash disposal of mercury lights...
...yet many lamps are illegally thrown in the trash where they are often broken and pose risks of worker exposure to mercury

Education to address this health threat often overlooks maintenance staff and low-income tenants

Estimated >8,200 tons of residential/commercial lights (mercury and LED) disposed in CA (2014)
Health Risks
- Drinking water limit: 2.0 parts per billion
  - when improperly managed, mercury products contaminate drinking water, fish populations, soil, and air.

Other Reasons to Recycle Lights!
- Recycling, rather than disposing can:
  - Recover valuable materials (glass and aluminum) to make other products:
  - Create recycling jobs;
  - Reduce the need for virgin materials to be extracted.

Types of Lights (continued)
- Energy efficient light emitting diode (LED) lights:
  - Don’t contain mercury BUT
  - Do contain heavy metals like lead, copper, nickel, and arsenic, as well as chemicals that have been linked to cancer, neurological damage, kidney disease, hypertension, and skin rashes.
    - These lights also need to be safely managed.

Mercury Lights Recycling in CA
- Must be recycled or disposed as hazardous waste
- Cannot be disposed in household trash, commercial solid waste, or landfills
- Are considered “universal waste” (a subset of hazardous waste) according to CA + federal EPA and have streamlined standards for handling, storage, and transport to encourage recycling but full hazardous waste requirements for fiscal recycling, treatment, and disposal. For example:
  - Can be stored for up to a year and are not required to be labeled with a manifest
  - Must be labeled and managed to prevent release into the environment;
  - Employees who handle universal waste must be trained on proper handling + emergency procedures
  - Must be transported to a facility that is permitted for recycling or disposal of universal/hazardous waste.

Best Management Practices
- If a light breaks at home:
  - Open doors and windows to ventilate the area for at least 15 minutes.
  - Turn off all electrical appliances to avoid creating mercury vapor.
  - Keep children and pregnant women out of the area during cleanup.
  - Wear a dust mask and gloves to keep body dust and glass from being inhaled or contacting your skin.
  - Remove large pieces and place them in a secure closed container.
  - Collect smaller pieces and dust. Use two half-pieces of paper such as index cards or a mercury spill kit, if available.
  - Put material into a sealed container. Put the area with the sticky side of duct, packaging, or masking tape. Wrap the area with a damp cloth.
  - Put all waste and materials used to clean up in a secure closed container and label it “Universal Waste – Broken Lamp”.
  - Take the container to a hazardous waste facility.

[For further guidance: epa.gov/ceas/cnapibia/cealightwaste/fluorescent/FluorescentLightWaste.htm#FluorescentBreaks]

Outreach Materials
Access website at: **www.productstewardship.us**

**Blair:** Definitely need to make the fact sheets bilingual.

**Bradley:** We should send this information to Recology, the local garbage company

**Judy Rosenfeld:** Might be strategic to develop curriculum for high school and middle school.

**Renay:** Regarding homeowners, should do they know how to dispose of these lights, how should they recycle them?

**Suna:** They have three versions of the residential fact sheets that people can use.

**Renay:** We need to make people more aware of this, especially in Bayview.

**Bradley:** could we hear a bit, Suna, about the difference between mercury lights and incandescent lights?

**Suna:** there have been low levels of toxics in the incandescents...but they can be put in the trash. San Francisco quick-light guide has good guidance on types of lights and how to identify them.

- Information on difference between mercury and incandescent lights (provided by Zsea Bowmani): [https://www.treehugger.com/led-light-bulbs-better-than-cfls-1203928](https://www.treehugger.com/led-light-bulbs-better-than-cfls-1203928)

**Dalila:** We will be sharing the slides along with the Baykeepers slides after the presentation.
Suna: will put in the chat the webpage where you can access the materials.

- **Drop-off locations in the 94124 area** (provided by Sraddha Mehta with SF Dept. of Environment):
  

- **Drop-off locations in the Greater San Francisco Bay Area**:
  

- **For more resources and fact sheets** on mercury disposal from PSI:
  
  [https://www.productstewardship.us/page/Safely-Managing-Fluorescent-Other-Lamps-CA](https://www.productstewardship.us/page/Safely-Managing-Fluorescent-Other-Lamps-CA)

[End Product Stewardship Institute Presentation & Discussion]

Dalila: Are there any other issues that people want to discuss?

Rebecca E. Skinner: Do we know anything about how the vaccine is being rolled out, given that Bayview is one of the main sites for vaccine distribution.

Renay: We don’t know much, we should have more information for the next meeting.

Dalila: We are still working on the November survey and sorting through that feedback.

Bradley: Wanted to suggest that we ask the air district to come to the next meeting, not only to participate in these discussions but – report to the community about the

  a) Darling International Inc – rendering plant in the port of SF
     - Particularly wondering about the issue of the permit (whether or not they have one) because their permit may have expired
     - It would be great for them to have a meeting to come to
     - It’s a facility that has been concerning people for decades
     - Folks without homes are often placed there
     - BAAQMD has been trying to get a straight answer for 5 months or so
     - Like the BAAQMD, we have not been hearing back from them about the air pollution
     - They have been operating without regulation for decades (without permits)
     - We believe that they should not just be awarded a permit after operating illegally for years
     - There’s two concrete plants that have been operating without permits for years. The Air District said “they’ll get permitted soon,” which we see as a problem, as they were going to be rewarded with a permit without having a chance for community discussion.
     - This would be a way to get the edges figured out about this.

Renay: I wanted to mention that the Air District had their first town hall, and will be having another town hall! We should help spread the message about this, maybe help them with outreach, so people in the community can go to those meetings. Let the community know that we can attend so that we can put pressure on these factories and companies - most are probably permitted, but we can show up and tell them that there are residents who do care about what is in their air, soil and water, and that they should work on cutting down their emissions.

Leaotis: Darling International has been a problem for a while. When you go by, you can’t stand it. It smells. Right here in Bayview. If they don’t have a permit, it’s illegal. It’s that simple.

Dalila: If that is all of the questions and comments we have, I want to thank everyone for coming and for keeping EJ Task Force going! I appreciate you all for showing up. Cheers to a hopefully better 2021.