

Bayview Hunters Point Environmental Justice Response Task Force

Part of the IVAN (Identifying Violations Affecting Neighborhoods) Network: [www.bvhp-ivan.org](http://www.bvhp-ivan.org)

**When:** Wednesday August 19, 2020

**Time:** 2:00 p.m. – 4:00 p.m.

**Location:** Zoom- <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87006426459>

**Call in #:** +1 (408) 638-0968 X 87006426459

**Meeting I.D:** 870 0642 6459

Participants:

AGENDA

**2:00 PM** Welcome

**2:10 PM** Community Announcements and Resources exchange

**2:25 PM** IVAN Complaints

**2:40 PM** Update on Biomonitoring for South Basin and ROC clusters by Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD

**3:10 PM** Update on San Francisco Planning Department's proposed "Standard Environmental Requirements" by Bradley Angel and Barry Hermanson

**3:30 PM** Air Monitoring Update by Dalila Adofo

**3:55 PM** Next Meeting Date and Time

**4:00 PM** Meeting Adjourned

MINUTES

2:00 Welcome

2:05 Community Announcements

Edgar: If you have lost income due to the COVID-19 pandemic, you may qualify for the Emergency Customer Assistance Program (ECAP). It is up to 30% discount on electric, a Wastewater and Sewer bills. And so, I'm going to be dropping down the link on the chat bar to see where folks can apply. It is for residence nonprofits and small businesses. And so that's probably one of the most comprehensive Bill relief programs aside from CARE and FERA. I shall be sharing that with you. Hopefully, this can help provide some economic support for folks who are currently struggling.

Dalila: Great thank you Edgar. Is there any other community announcements or resources? No. Well we could also use this time to welcome Veronica Eady and Veronica if you want to just kind of introduce yourself in your new role.

Veronica: Thank you. Dalila. I am really happy to be here and I'm now working with the air District. I am the air districts first senior Deputy executive officer for Policy and Equity. So, I'm going to be leading a lot of the work that impacts of Bayview Hunters Point Community. So that includes AB617 work, CARE work, all our Equity policy in environmental justice work. So, I'm really excited to be here for many decades ago was a resident of Bayview Hunters Point. I am sorry to say I was an early gentrifier, but I know the community and I care about it a lot. So, I'm really excited to be here and be working with you all and hope to stay as engaged as I can in the Grassroots efforts including the IVAN task force meeting. So, I hope that our other air District staff like Joshua Abraham don't mind if I'm around lurking and just keeping track of what's going on with you all. Thanks. Dalila.

Dalila: Thanks Veronica. Alright, with that if there is no other community announcements or resource exchanges we can go ahead and get into Ivan. So, thanks to the youth leadership academy. We have plenty of Ivan reports. So, the first one starting back from July 21st. Human waste on Van Dyke is the first one. Then we have trash next to freeway massive amounts of waste on the side of the freeway 101. We also dog waste on Phelps Ave. We have trash on 2000 Bancroft Ave. Dumping on the street on Donner Avenue, San Francisco. Trash and tree debris at park, I assume that it was Martin Luther Park. Trash on the ground for Yosemite Ave. Pollution at Van Dyke. *Description:* I checked the human feces was still outside my area, so they're saying it's been weeks that is on Van Dyke. Trash on the sidewalk on Jerrold. Trash on Las Villas

Court. Trash/ Solid Waste on Newcomb and some of our last ones are trash on V Hudson Ave. Garbage on the streets on Van Dyke. No street cleaning on Oakridge Dr. in Daly City. Van Dyke air pollution-  
*Description:* currently living in BVHP and the air is filled with dust I can't stop sneezing as I have my window open from this weird heat. That was over the weekend. Trash in the bushes on Galvez. Raw sewage at Candlestick point on Coleman. *Description:* We continue to experience with human waste in Candlestick Cove area where we windsurfers. The smell is evident, and we have had bad water quality issues. Garbage on Van Dyke again. Trash litter on Arthur Ave. And this is our last one, Francisco Da Costa. *Description:* The tenants at Alice Griffith are having serious air contamination problems. Complaints were made with no results. I had to contact the office of emergency services and the Bay Area Air Quality District. Both have promised to help the community at large. There is an added situation to many trailers at the SF state park. In close proximity to the former candlestick park. Heap of dirt at the park and nearby at the park and nearby by Arelius Walker Road. The stench is horrible. There is a malfunction of the Pump linked to the sewage system. The complaints are not heeded. If something is not done, then the pandemic can trigger very serious consequences. So those are complaints we got. Francisco, don't feel pressured but do you want to speak more on the complaint?

Francisco: Yeah, I want to speak more. So normally, I don't get involved too much because my plate is full with other issues, but too many community members have called me. And so, we have different locations, we have for Alice Griffith where they are not allowing them to open the windows. And HABC system doesn't work and hasn't been working for months. The people are suffering. And begging everybody and there is no advocacy there and no Advocate who knows the process. That's one situation at Alice Griffith. At the San Francisco State Park which is the only state park in San Francisco that are many trailers and heaps and heaps of garbage and nothing has been done about this situation for months. Now Arelius Walker and you are loaded to it the off switch. That's an ongoing thing and nobody is doing anything about it. Most probably it may be also a faulty pump which is close by. What I did is I call I sent a number of emails and one of the emails went to Angel Bradley and angel said you know that prior to filling out form that I should call the Bay Area Air Quality Management District, which I did. So, what happened I go, a gentleman named Simon. He called me and I told him exactly what I'm telling ya'll and he said that Quality Management District cannot do anything about it because they don't deal with odor and stuff like that. I know too much about the Bay Area Air Quality Management District over the years our fight with Lennar in which we were victorious winning. They were fined \$550,000 and I'll stop there. Regarding the and I think so the Bay Area air quality District some jurisdiction over Alice Griffith. They do also have some jurisdiction over the state park. But the gentleman tells me when it comes to odor and things like that that's not their purview and that's fine. So, what I'm saying is there have been some tenants who have begged the district 10 supervisor, Shamman Walton to do something for months. Nothing has been done. They have sent signals to the mayor, London breed, nothing has been done. We have empirical data that the southeast sector has a higher amount of covid-19 cases yet. Nothing has been done holistically. Some trailers have been put on Pier 94. Pier 94 is already very contaminated ground and then they put our elders over there with underlying ailments. Now I see you, I don't know if I have met you, but you had a number of complaints. Dog feces and mostly garbage and stuff like that right as a director of environmental justice advocacy. For the last 40 years. I've been fighting for quality-of-life issues. And as a representative from the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission among ya'll and I been fighting that they use Community benefits for the community for example if green action was given 10 million dollars of the three hundred million dollars that they have And Ill reach that they can only account for because of the FBI 340,200,000 which is the tip of the iceberg. With 10 million dollars green action could have done a lot. Some others could have gotten a lot. I would not accept a dollar from the government. I don't accept a dollar from the government. Because I don't want anybody to do pull strings and use me like a puppet and then these people come and say "oh, you know. For residential people we will give you some break and all" that's all Bs. in the 1960s, the community fought so that the treatment plant could be upgraded. And then we had a task force and a task force set aside 5% of a billion, which is 50 million times 6. 300 million for Community benefits. That's what we want. Organizations need that type of money for resources to do something. I just complained about some dog shat on the stairs or a little pile of garbage. No! What are we doing about our infants? What are we doing about our children? What are we doing about our youth? What are we doing about young adults? What are we doing about our beloved Elders? What are we doing about those with compromise health? What are we doing about the mentally and

physically challenged? This should be our focus. Now, I knew. And I feel ya'll know who I'm talking about who passed away. Marie Harrison. She used to confide in me. She came to City Hall with a ventilator. And begged the Supervisors to do right and they do the wrong. They disrespected her. We should not be disrespected. Besides, I represent the first people of San Francisco, The Muwekma Ohlone. I'm paying attention and I am doing what I can on a higher level. So that these crooks will go to jail and some of them will. Over 40 subpoenas will be handed over shortly. I used to come to some of your meetings, when there is time. and when I feel that I should go. I was there for one Memorial meeting. And some guy came from the Bay Area air quality management talking BS. Then I spoke up and told him who I was. The Bay Area air quality management had the audacity to shred documents and a few whistleblowers were suspended and fired for doing right, so I want to cut short. We need to take these people to a higher-level. We need to report this to David Anderson, attorney general from the federal government and you can use my name if you want to. That's what we want to do. You can't have sewage there for months. People smelling the sewage. Piles and piles of dirt and you got to stench from half a mile away. Alice Griffith the people sweating over there because it's so warm and the ventilation system is not working. What else? Why do they treat poor people with disdain? Why do they treat poor people like dirt? That must stop! Thank you for listening to me and God bless you for the type of work you are doing.

Dalila: Bradley you have your hands up.

Bradley: Thank you for the Francisco for that important information and statements. and I just wanted to mention that if I heard correctly Francisco related that the air District inspector may have said that agency does not deal with odor complaints.

Francisco: Yeah. He said that Bradley. You know, I am not blaming him because there is a high percentage maybe 80 or 90 percentage that the area is contaminated with covid. And I take it requires special personal protection equipment and that's why was he was hesitant, but he did very clearly tell me. The Bay Area Air Quality Management District doesn't go inside the building and testing the air and stuff like that. That's what he told me. I just listen to him

Bradley: Ok yeah inside the building. I didn't hear that part. Certainly, for odors outside they are. That is their jurisdiction. Thank you so much Francisco for the very important information and your work.

Francisco: Thank you very much

Dalila: Thank you. Eric did you have comments?

Eric: Yeah, just quickly to Francisco just wanted to identify I think you might have just said this is so they're telling people they can't open their windows because of the virus.

Francisco: No, no, no. I didn't say that. It has been some time now that the ventilation system doesn't work. So, some of the people are so frustrated because of the humidity. It is warm temperature. One of them. His name is Dwayne Gaines. He asked them, please open the windows and they said no we can't open the windows. So, are they going to suffer for one week, two weeks, three weeks, that's what's happening? Today they send me a big email saying you've got to go to the mail and ask them for rooms and all that. I mean, everybody gets frustrated. And they say, Oh, I'm going to sue them and all but we know that what is right is that the feds got the empirical data and charge them and hopefully some of them go for vacation in the jails for a long long time. That's good that's going for the jugular. Otherwise they just kick the can down the street. Now ready not allowed at Lennar. We went again and again to the Bay Area quality this and then fine them out \$550,000. But that's just the beginning. Then what happened to add the spiraling of the economy in 2008 and 2009. And then our stock went down to just \$3 and 20 cents. That was good for them. And they learned a lesson some lesson. But there Lennar, as I labeled them a long time ago is a rogue developer. And we the community did what we did because we were fighting for the children. We were fighting for those people that didn't have a voice. We did good. We did good. But there's more to be done. And so, Bradley Angel and Marie Harrison and Espinola Jackson. I can go on and on and on. They did what they did. And Angel knows me for a long long time, and I know Angel for a long, long time. And soon you will hear a report from Dr. Ahimsa Sumchai. She ran around asking for the place nobody would give her a place. I give her a place. I turned over my office to her. Because when you do God's work, you need to be helped. That's where I come from. So, if I've said I know Angel understands what I'm saying, we need to do something about this at the highest level, because our children are dying. I stand for our children, I stand for our single mothers, I stand for I elders and I stand for anybody who cannot defend themselves. I'm now not feeling well,

I'm in my bed. But anyway, you know, God's giving me some strength to speak up. And I think I'll leave and thank you once again for hearing me.

Dalila: Thank you Francisco. Does anybody on the call have any insight in terms of how to deal with the issues that Francisco has brought up?

Eric: Well, this is Eric Brooks again. I'm with our city, San Francisco. On the tenant stuff. I recommend contacting housing rights committee [hrssf.org](http://hrssf.org). And then maybe the tenant's union and tenants together. I think [HRCSF.org](http://HRCSF.org) would be the first one to contact them if they haven't talked to them already because I know that they've been working on HUD funding and I'm sure that they're interested in what's going on, but they might not know about it. So, somebody needs to alert them, [HRCSF.Org](http://HRCSF.Org).

Dalila: Thank you, Eric anyone else?

Dr. Ahimsa Sumchai: Well public housing of course is federal housing and there's a federal response that needs to be raised for a population of people, you know, living in in federal housing and I'm not sure if any legislative avenues have been taken, you know, what the outreach has been. If people are acutely endangered, then you know, there needs to be an immediate response. I didn't get a sense as to whether these are...It sounds like these are urgent kind of concerns. But you know, the ultimate redress is going to have to come probably at the federal level. I don't know if the Housing Authority has been contacted. I mean, I hate to send you through all of the bureaucratic stuff. It's unfortunate that Francisco won't be able to join us at the rally, that would be a great opportunity to publicly voice these issues and to invite some of the affected impacted people to attend. And you know bring that type of focus to this concern.

Dalila: Francisco if you can't make it, is there someone who has talked to you about this and is willing to do the Caravan?

Francisco: You know, I can't make it. I had promised Angel I will try my best, but the doctor has advised me to stay indoors because of my age. And so, I can make it I can't take a risk like that. I'm not going anywhere out. You know, I'm staying at home. But I can ask around. Kevin Williams has been helping me and Gaines. He's the one who brought this to my attention. I can ask him if he can join the caravan and I can ask, Kevin. That's what that's what I can do. I'll try my best. Yeah, if I was like, in the old days, we took a lot of buses and all to Sacramento and all and did whatever we had to do. But I'll try my best.

Dalila: Is there any other comments for Francisco's complaint. If not, I would like to turn our attention back to another complaint complaining about raw sewage near Candlestick Park. And the Dumping of human waste and Candlestick sewage water quality issues. SFPUC is on the line. I'm not sure. I don't think that. Another water Departments on the line. But is there a way that that can be investigated or does somebody have a contact wear that can be investigated?

Edgar: Hi, this is Edgar from SFPUC Am I going to pull up this item and do an internal investigation on my own and see where to uplift that.

Dalila: Ok great thank you Edgar. And I can forward you the complaint as well in an email. All right, so other than that, it's the excessive trash garbage at different locations. I know that the illegal dumping subcommittee is working on how to solve that issue in a general sense. Does anybody else have any comments about any rest of the complaints or any solutions, possible contacts? Alright, with that we can go on to Dr. Ahimsa Sumchai's presentation. Let me pull up the presentation.

Eric: While you're doing that. Can I ask that anybody who's here from an agency, can you edit your name So that it also says your agency? Some of you already did that. Would be good for that to be in your name.

Dalila: Yes. Thank you.

2:45 Update on Biomonitoring for South Basin and ROC clusters by Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD

Dr. Ahimsa Sumchai: So, I wanted to revisit some of the progress that we have been making at the Hunters Point community biomonitoring program, especially since we have implemented what is termed geospatial mapping and analysis of our findings. And when I last spoke to you, I talked with you about a pattern that we were identifying just based on visual pattern recognition, you know, the NASA supercomputer network was not involved in you know, the patterns. I am sure that Dalila will recall when we were walking around Arelious Walker area of the shipyard in South basin and making decisions about the air monitoring, that I thought we were seeing a pattern of arsenic in the area that emerged just very, very quickly. So, before I dive into the expanded mapping of the South Basin cluster which you have before you, let me

just give you some information about human bio monitoring in its simplicity. It is a chemical analytic method for detecting of pollution in people. The testing that we're doing is conducted by certified laboratory. It relies on a mass spec, which analyzes multiple analytes and categorizes them based on essentially their charge to mass ratio and I have been doing a deep advanced search on human biomonitoring globally because of some of the findings that we have had that have been a quite mind-blowing for the relatively small population of screenings. The testing that were doing as some of you know, allows us to analyze 35 different analytes. There is a panel of toxic analytes. These are elements like lead and uranium, cesium and valium that have no role in human physiology. They don't need to be tolerated in any concentration of when they are detected but there are still some reference range of concentrations that are allowable. Then we also have a panel of withal nutritive elements. These are elements that can be present in concentrations that are too low to high. They exist within what is called a homeostatic range. We need things like iron, and we need things like calcium and magnesium and the human immune system requires zinc it is absolutely essential that zinc is present. What we're seeing among the nutritive elements is a pattern towards people having nutritional deficiencies and toxic elevations and analysts that are potentially dangerous. One of the things that surprised me, I expected it when we were screening low-income people especially around the Hunters Point Hilltop that we would detect nutritional deficiency up there because that's a food island up there, you know, there are just very few services period. But what we were seeing were deficiencies in nutrient elements in men of many of the workers that we have screened who rely on iron and calcium and magnesium for muscular bone structural integrity and physical strength. They were displaying these patterns of deficiencies in the nutritional elements. So human biomonitoring has gone back much further than I first thought. In 1960-70 EPA first established the National Human Monitoring program and that branched off into us some in Haines studies. These are really early studies and in general they were looking at either one or few analytes. Frequently, they were looking at organic vs. inorganic and pcbs and Lead and mercury. In 1986, there was a Superfund basic research program funded by the National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences. Which is quite mind blowing and what they did was they granted money to University level researchers to conduct select biomonitoring studies at Superfund sites and many of these studies were done on a human subjects. Most of them involve marine animals, biota, as it's called. What was most significant in my advanced search is that there appear to be, and perhaps I'm wrong, but at this point there appear to be no human bio monitoring programs in the medical literature that have identified what's called an aggregate analysis where you're seeing multiple abnormal analytes on biomonitoring screening involving metals that are with no radioisotopes. So that means that our finding, and I will show you some of the clusters of from the rock, the radio radioactive element mapping, thats brand-new. There's no one else who has done that and that enhances the significance of the information to find multiple potential radioactive elements in multiple screens. So this is South Basin cluster, and if you recall, it is a specific cluster that we identified when instead of looking at all 35 analytes on a urine screening, we just focused on four and four are arsenic in the red. The red pin is arsenic. Gadolinium is the blue pin. Manganese is the yellow pin, and the white pin is vanadium and to enter the South Basin clutch. You have to have three of the four chemicals in your urine detected in concentrations that are above reference range and potentially toxic especially for the Arsenic. As soon as you get to 50 again for arsenic, you're in a toxic range. So what it is more evidence now, I think, is that there are these families and individuals who have the three elements and then it I think I mentioned to you last time that we had a lady a right at the Bayview Hills boundary of 3rd Street who had all four elements detected in concentrations that are above reference range potentially toxic. So, when I last presented this map to you, we had nine separate screenings, and this represents 13 separate screens. So, what this has done to me is confirmed my belief that the South Basin cluster is real. When I was first seeing the Arsenic patterns, I thought it was significant and then certainly over the last 3 months of the emergence of more and more screenings with these four specific chemicals being detected. Again, its called an aggregate analysis when we see if a group of chemicals like this. Again, in my opinion, the South Basin cluster is real and in you know, my opinion. It is something that needs to be acted on. I did contact The California Department of Health Services, and I was checking through the bureaucratic hurdle that happens when you make a report I like that and I'm not sure to date what has come of it. But again, we are now up to 13 separate screenings in which his pattern is emerging. So, the next thing I would like to do is to introduce you to a new cluster that emerged this is a map of the radiologically impacted regions of the Hunters Point Shipyard a federal Superfund Site. I am rethinking my opinions about The Hunters Point Shipyard. It is more than a federal Superfund Site is a super

Superfund Site. It is a system of Superfund sites. The main federal Superfund sites spawned the E2 landfill that you see there a just north of the South Basin and the flow of the South Basin has contributed to contamination of Yosemite slew. So, there are a system of three of EPA designated Federal Superfund sites that we are actually looking at and we should recognize the enormity of this of this impact and I just emphasize it. This map of which looks really bad and it identifies as you can see in the gray hash areas that most of the base is radiologically impacted and when you are radiologically impacted that's a historical designation that never goes away and this map as you can see in the right-hand corner was developed by Tetra Tech. Tetra. So you know that if Tetra Tech created a map of it looks this bad, it's probably a hell of a lot worse, you know, but what we were able to do with this map is we were able to go through our screening and identify select screenings in which six irrefutably radioactive elements are being detected with significant frequency and the pins represent: Yellow for uranium, a green for cesium, black for thallium, blue for gadolinium, red for rubidium and white for strontium. And the only thing that you need to recognize on the map is that the cluster of people who have potentially radioactive elements in their urine is centered around 3rd and Palou and it travels eastward along the side of the parcel E shoreline where it is clustered in building 830. So, some of this is a selection process. We haven't tested any of the police officers in building a 606 which is further east and I tested my first artist whose on a parcel c and I'm looking forward to her result as well as screening some of the artists. It is pretty clear that the cluster of elements that are irrefutably potentially radioactive are clustered around the shipyards entry, which was the main drag for the United States Naval radiological defense Laboratory whose massive laboratory complex was housed in the building 800 series located on the parcel E Shoreline. Those buildings are still there. They're fuds. They were never cleared by the California Department of Health Services for human reuse. They are designated as radiologically impacted their designated on this map. And in Navy documents, its radiologically impacted and the workers in building 830 right now are going through a real travesty. They are being exposed; we have a photo from last week where the parcel E shoreline was being excavated at the fence line of the property where they're working. The University of California, San Francisco, Nobel prize-winning Medical Institution is still taking the basic position that everything is fine. And this is all and everybody's head. So, let's go on to the next slide. This is an update or it's a close-up view and again the yellow is uranium. What I'd like you to appreciate is how frequently thallium is being detected. It is the black pin and one of the scariest things that we're seeing are people who have toxic levels of Arsenic and elevated and toxic levels of thallium. thallium is a real bad actor. thallium, as you know, is a radioactive element it has been used as a rodent killer. It is so effective that its banned now. To have people who have urine screenings that both detect Arsenic and thallium in elevated and toxic concentrations is quite alarming. The next slide shows from the historical radiological assessment of the radio nuclides of concern that expert scientist the cream-of-the-crop the best and the brightest thought were significant and used at the shipyard and those of you know, elements include things like thallium and uranium and his daughters and strontium and gadolinium and a many of the elements that we're detecting. It's important to note that of this list of radio nuclides of concern that the HRA identify, the Navy has whittled it down to six. I've been urging them to include thallium. It makes sense. Thallium being studied by all of your bio monitoring programs. It is being detected in human bodies and we know that it was used both industrially and doing research a body in RDL. So, the Navy has whittled it down to 6 in my opinion that the Navy's inclusion of radionuclides like americium and europium. Thats just a waste of time. I don't think there's anything in the historical record that supports that americium was used or is a problem, you know, at the shipyard and here we are identifying elements that they should consider as alternatives. They have identified thorium as one of their chemicals of concern. I think that if they recognized the impact thorium, they should recognize the impact of thallium because it is such a bad actor. Let's get going into this chart. The main thing that this chart does, I previously have shown you the same type of diagram from parcel A soil. This is a diagram of a chart that depicts chemicals of concern that are specifically being remediated in parcel C soils. The reason I chose this chart instead of the one that I had shown you before is that both of these charts identify that the major chemicals of concern that we keep seeing the Arsenic, the thallium, the vanadium and the manganese. These are documented in parcel C soils. The difference with this graph is it looks at a bunch of analyses and it gives you information about the absolute number of detections of each of the chemicals, how often it was detected and it also gives you their maximum minimum of detected concentrations and it gives you a percentage of how often the element was detected in a concentration that exceeded the remediation goal. Now just look at that number, detections greater than remediation goal. You

see that column. That's the most important column in this whole map. Look at that. This is telling you that virtually every chemical here exceeded its concentration above remediation goal in these studies. The Navy is telling you that all of these chemicals that they detected were present in concentrations greater than the remediation goal. So, when you're hearing, you know, the Navy tell you everything is hunky-dory and it's all cleaned up. That's why you have to give some critical analysis to you know, studies like this that can be a little boring. The most important thing I want to leave you with is the answer to why we're seeing Arsenic and manganese and Vanadium and elements like that being detected in a such a high frequency in people that are screened. The simple answer is because they are being detected in one hundred percent of samples in the soils. This is showing you detection frequencies of these chemicals that are approaching 100%. So that is the fundamental answer. I'm going to leave by asking you guys a question. Have you ever heard of Occam's razor? Especially any of the EJ students have any of you heard of Occam's razor? Occam's razor is a simple scientific philosophical stance that was first espoused by William Ockham in the 14th century. He was a theologian philosopher and all it says is that the simplest answer is most often correct. In fact, it steers scientist of all disciplines away from complex answers the simplest answer the obvious answer and in my conclusion. I just want to say that I've had professional people go loopy on me about some of the radiological issues that we're raising with our detections. I've had, you know emails and phone calls and stuff responses that really have been over the top about some of the radiological findings. And again, this is pioneering a work but at the end of the day or if you were detecting products of nuclear fission, and general radiological materials that are documented and present in the historical radiological assessment in workers and residents living within a one-mile radius of a federal Superfund Site where radiological research, you know was conducted from 1946 to 1986 were the bombs dropped on Bikini Atoll and a shot Baker those ships for back for radioactive fuel and was burned over the base. So, the finding of these radionuclides and chemicals of concern in people's urine at this point should just be reduced to Occam's razor. The simplest answer is the easiest and the Hunters Point Shipyard clearly is a source of these elements that were detected. I like his photo. Yes. I think that's one of the most glorious images of the community and I have expressed publicly that there's something perverse and cruel but unifying in the work that were doing. To have, you know, a 15 year old African American male, Chinese males, Chinese females white workers on the shipyard, African-American females people living on the hilltop people living in the South Basin region with many of the same elements showing up in their urine. There is a sense of community and this a lot of this work grew out of a family. The Cunningham family, they are willing to be identified, the patterns that we are seeing in the South Basin cluster first emerged in that family and then it fanned out to include people who are literally, you know, their neighbors. So, you know, at the end of the day there is some importance in recognizing the metaphor of how much a community that were seeing in the work we're doing.

Dalila: Thank you Dr. Ahimsa. Are there any questions for Ahimsa?

Francisco: Can I say something please?

Dalila: Oh, I'm sorry Francisco. I had some people in the chat. Okay, so Eric Brooks first.

Eric: So, Ahimsa, this is the first time I've seen Maps where, including especially tetrachloro Maps, where there were detections outside of the parcels. And I was wondering how many maps are there like that? Have you guys track them down or have you or other people track them down and are they in a central place where they can be got looked at? I hope they are on the web, that show detections outside of the parcels.

Dr. Ahimsa: Right, do you understand that I personally put pins in the address of a map of hard copy map that I have in the medical office. You're welcome to come down and see both of these Maps. One of the maps the South Basin map Dalila gave me you remember when you gave me that map and its precious. Thank you. We were having problems electronically creating digital mapping system. These are physical maps and all I do at the level of you know, maybe a tenth grade science project is when I detect an element in the urine that is elevated above reference range for the general population. I just put the pin the map and that's how the Clusters emerge and yes the radio, the rock map which I call it, the map of elements that clearly are identified as having radionuclides extends to 3<sup>rd</sup> and Palou and includes three neighbors a married couple and you know a female who have a similar elements in their urine that is the kind of stuff that is very difficult to explain away.

Eric: So, these are tests that you have done, on people as a doctor, is that correct?

Dr. Ahimsa: Yes, yes

Eric: If you can make those maps available online at web links. That would really be good.

Dr. Ahimsa: Well I can certainly help load them. They are in the hard drive on my computer.

Eric: I would like to be able to use them as an example for when we're talking to people about both these parcels and about Treasure Island.

Dr. Ahimsa: Okay, and then I don't know, Dalila would you just share the presentation?

Dalila: Yeah absolutely.

Eric: You could email to me as well

Dalila: Could you please either privately chat me your email or I can also put the presentation on the IVAN website. If that's okay. Okay, cool, so Blair?

Blair: Hi, Dr. Sumchai thank you so much for your work and it's really clear what you're doing too. I mean the way you presented. I have one question, so if we look so here right kind of directly above where it says E-2 there's a whole big cluster right there on the boundary and that makes sense. You said that was the entrance to the radiological labs and all. But there are also these pretty significant clusters further to the left away from. Do you have an explanation for these specific clusters are these were people live who worked at the shipyard?

Dr. Ahimsa: No those are residents. I know it looks like a distance, but this is Oakdale and Palou and that's a block away

Blair: Okay. So, in other words the exposures here are also just because they live so close to the land that was so toxic.

Dr. Ahimsa: That is certainly what it looks like. I mean that is Occam's razor. When you find an aggregate cluster like this, you have to think about airborne, water-borne and the likelihood that they're all eating the same contaminated food. You have to think about Airborne dissemination, you know, I believe for the pattern that were seeing here. This is building 830 these are the UCSF workers. These are a group of people where there's the lady who has a uranium level 17 times higher than reference range. I have permission to say this Willie Radcliffe, it's in the paper, has uranium in his urine. All of them, Mary, Willie, and their neighbor have thallium detected. Some of these are people I know. When you spend an hour evaluating someone in 10 hours creating a report you really do get to know to know them and these kinds of patterns are significant.

Blair: Right, so I just wanted to be clear for myself. Thank you. So for when I talk with people this I just wanted to make sure that this was not because these people work at the shipyard the point is that all of us who live near the shipyard are at risk whether or not we actually worked at the shipyard just because we live nearby. Thank you so much.

Dr. Ahimsa: Yes. The intensity of exposure tends to be factored by proximity to and duration of exposure.

Dalila: Alright. Thank you, Francisco.

Francisco: Okay. Can you hear me? Okay, so first and foremost, I want to thank Dr. Ahimsa for doing God's work. We have Maps. Yes, we have maps. We have a lot of maps and we have them in hard cover and we have them on discs. But we need a team of experts who can use them preferably under the guidance of Dr. Ahimsa wherever she designates. So, I collected all the empirical data. Cuz when you have the empirical data, you don't have to go begging just like I collected all the empirical data so that somebody could go and issued a subpoena. So that's what I do. So, Eric has always supported us from the days when we had the movement with Lennar. There are others who are not aware that we have the empirical data. That's what I wanted to say. Thank you very much.

Dalila: Ok, does anybody else have any questions or comments for Dr. Ahimsa. No one knew that Occam's razor was the simplest explanation. Oh, one of the things that I found about Occam's razor was it tends to be statistically correct if you apply it. Statistically you are more likely to be correct if you apply Occam's razor.

Eric: A couple of us did we said it in the chat.

Dalila: Yea, Eric and I think Blair. I haven't heard about that. Definitely going to have to look that up more. Okay, great. So, we can move on to the presentation with Bradley and Barry Hermanson. I can go ahead and share my screen.

Bradley: Sounds good. And Eric Brooks is going to join. Okay, Barry and Eric. I'll just introduce it and turn it over to both of you.

Eric: Barry, do you want to kick it off? for most fluent.



Barry: Go ahead Eric

Bradley: I'm just going to actually start it real quick. Hi everybody, so back when- and I know the Leaotis Martin from the mothers and fathers committee is in this meeting today as well-, but I think it was back in January or February. I had come across a notice from the planning department that they were having a workshop around a proposal to amend a code with what they call Standard Environmental requirements. So, I checked it out. I went to the website and they quite brazenly and openly stated that the purpose of this was to streamline approval not streamline consideration for decisions, streamline approval of big development projects in San Francisco. So, I was concerned immediately that this had nothing to do with cutting bureaucracy but had everything to do with ramming through development projects. Some of which could have serious environmental and other negative social impacts such as gentrification. Based on all our years to experience dealing with the planning department around big developments in Bayview Hunters Point specifically such as the Lennar mega development that the planning department and City Hall pushed through you know thinking it's just fine to live next to Atomic Bomb waste. Knowing what they're doing in Treasure Island, same thing the India Basin mixed-use project that the planning department not that long before approved even though the city's own EIR confirmed that project, the commercial component, would cause significant harmful and forever and unavoidable air pollution in Bayview Hunters Point and that it would be localized. And of course, the city approved that. Our concern is up. We had also communicated to the planning department about the fact that this notice was in English only. Even though San Francisco is very diverse community as you all know. There's quite a few languages spoken by large percentage of the population, but tough luck if you speak one of those languages because the department continues not to care. Leaotis and I went to the meeting and we walked in and the room had, we didn't see any other community people. It was pretty much all developers and their consultants. So, we immediately raised concerns as the meeting started around the lack of language access and proper notice. We raised concerns about the bold statement on the planning department announcement for this that the purpose was to expedite and streamline approval, not a consideration, approval of development projects and we look into it and we saw that this would really undermine the public's right to civically engage. It would undermine the California Environmental Quality Act and unfortunately, they threatened Leaotis and I with arrest for speaking out and bringing the truth to know to the floor. And then they broke up into small groups and at that point several people came up and thanked us, some different neighborhood activists as well as Attorney Richard J who is an expert at CEQA. And coming out of that we reached out to Eric Brooks of Our City, Barry Hermanson and others during the meeting. And yesterday, an incredibly broad San Francisco Coalition some of whom we have worked with on a regular basis some with whom we don't and that's the beauty of it there's people from diverse backgrounds who actually care about our city, who care about the Public's right to participate in decisions, who care about not building homes on top of toxic radioactive waste. We came together and released a letter to the Board of Supervisors yesterday. It's on the screen. So, I'm going to turn it over to Eric and Barry to take it from there, but it's really important and it affects everybody whether you're in the community or in a government agency. So, take it away. Eric and Barry.

Eric: Yeah, so I'm Eric Brooks. For those of you that don't know me in 2004, I helped-Barry helped with this as well- get an organization off the ground called Our City, San Francisco it spun off of the Matt Gonzalez for mayor campaign. He was a green that almost won the Mayor's Race in 2003. Since then we worked on various issues some of which have been in the Bayview like we helped some on the one Lennar situation. I helped coordinated campaign, some of you might remember, to stop new natural gas power plants from being put on the doorstep of the Bayview. Also, recently helped coordinate the campaign stop Candlestick Stadium for being blown up instead of taking it apart properly and not created the dust, we helped on that. A few times we've worked on this issue of the planning department trying to weaken our California Environmental Quality Act protections. That's what these are. It's called C.E.Q.A for short. Back in 2006 and 2010 and 2012, then supervisors Makayla Elliott appear, and Scott Weiner tried to do this exact same sort of thing. And each time it was after the suggestion of the planning department staff. So, this is just the latest time they're trying to undermine our ability to call projects before public scrutiny and make sure that good environmental impact reports are done on them. And I'm sure all of you probably know what environmental impact report is because Lennar is ground zero in your area with the Hunters Point Shipyard. So those are crucial. This new proposal from the planning department staff gives the planning department staff on their own even individually the power to make up what's called a categorical exemption for any

development project on any environmental impacts. Conceivably this could even affect the shipyard and Treasure Island even though they are very serious cases. So, it basically would give the planning staff the ability to just waive California Environmental Quality act in San Francisco, and it could legitimately be called a repeal of the Environmental Quality act locally in San Francisco. It's the most simple and serious attack they've launched yet. And the last time we fought this fight in 2012 with Scott Wiener, we waited a little bit longer than we probably should have to engage the fight and they ended up winning one thing which was instead of 90 days to comment on environmental impact report or a project approval, I should say a project approval, You have a different set up for environmental impact reports. instead of 90 days for project approval. Now, we have 30 days and that was the only thing we lost we pretty much made the law stronger instead of weaker. So, Wiener really messed up when he tried that but this is serious enough and we don't want to repeat losing any point even that one for it. So were getting in gear ahead of time. We are already contacting the supervisors before planning even goes to its commission with this. So this time we can just nip it in the butt and make sure that doesn't happen at all and were also using it as an opportunity to say you need to turn that 30 days back into at least 60 days to give the public more time to be aware of categorical exemptions. And that means that the planning department and commission look at a project and decide according to the law there's no impact that there needs to be a public hearing for so there doesn't need to be one and there doesn't need to be an environmental impact report. So, this just makes it so they can just flipidly do that on a whim even making up new rules and new laws as they go along and thats why I so crucial that we fight it. So some of you like Leatosis's group has already signed on to this. If any of you are in organizations and you want to sign on to this letter, we're going to continue to get sign ons and please just email Bradley or me. I'm going to put my email address again in the chat. So, if you want to sign on email your group logo and your group name to me and Bradley and we can add you to the letter. If you don't have a logo, thats okay. But if you have one, please send it. So thats pretty much it and I'll just open it up to Barry to add anything he wants to add.

Barry: So just one other comment, if they pass this this would essentially codified stuff that they have been doing already. There's been over the last few years, projects that have been built over areas, that should have been tested. And in fact, it has been community opposition that has stopped a couple of projects out here in the sunset District. In one case, a large tank that is used to store gasoline that extended under part of Judah Street and under Apartments. Community opposition stopped them because no you can't leave that stuff in the ground and it risks our groundwater which is now starting to mix into hetch hetchy water, not in a large percentage, but still it's it's not good. There's another project over on Greenwich Street where there was a garage that closed. And the planning department just wanted to let this go right on through without a sufficient environmental impact report. And fortunately, the community has put up so much of an opposition that this may get stalled. The planning department is trying to make it very easy for developers and we say the community needs to have a voice. I'm representing the Sierra Club and the San Francisco Green party and we're both listed as organization supporting this letter.

Dr. Ahimsa: Who are the supervisors sponsoring this?

Barry: The Supervisors are not

Eric: Thats why we're doing this now because they haven't gotten to that stage yet. We want to get out ahead of it. So that this time we don't lose any points. To the person that asked about why it's 60 days instead of 90 days, it's a big long technical answer but it makes sense for the categorical exemptions, which is what we're targeting because of what they're putting forward to have 60. We can ask for anything if we get a big enough group of people to get angry enough we can ask for a much stronger Environmental Quality laws, and at the very least even if we don't get everything we want it'll prevent them from doing this again because they'll know that what well do is come back and ask for stronger laws instead of weaker ones. Somebody in the chat asked to see all the signers so whoever was doing share screen show the entire letter.

Barry: They did,

Eric: The top of the letter where it has the logos. And make that as big as possible so people can see all of them. and there are I think three other groups that are not on there because they don't have logos that are down at the bottom. One of them is Outlands planning committee or something like that. Dance mission is one of them.

Dr. Ahimsa: Is the initiative coming out of planning? Where is the initiative coming from?

Barry: The Mayor's office. And the mayor appoints all these people.

Eric: It starting with planning staff just as it has every time and as Bradley said the first thing they did was had internal hearings on it that they invited the public to and that was just with the planning staff. So right now, it's just at the planning staff stage and that's where we want to keep it.

Barry: And I personally think that because of the pushback that this group of folks and organizations are providing, the hearing- where this would be agendaized-has been pushed back. So, they currently do not have the date where it is going to be heard. They're leaving kind of open. It's indefinite and in my mind, it's waiting to see if nobody's paying attention and then they'll push it through. So, this is an effort to, as Eric said before, just to snuff it out right now.

Eric: Just to add, people were asking, Friends of the Music Concourse is the other one that's not listed in the images. And then just to let you guys know we also have, they're not on the letter itself, but at the bottom of the letter it shows unions that have sent their own letters and other groups. So, Coalition for San Francisco neighborhoods, San Francisco historic preservation committee, Northern California District Council laborers, the electricians, and the food workers.

Dr. Ahimsa: Congratulations on this organizing effort, it's incredible.

Eric: There was a comment in the chat. Is there any social media campaign going on regarding this and I don't know of any?

Barry: There isn't one yet because what we're trying to do first, is fly under the radar and talk to all the supervisors one-on-one and see if we can get six of them at least, to just be opposed to this already and then that means it's dead. And as soon as we've got that kind of support then we'll be ready to go to something more public to say "you guys sure you really want to do this?", but we don't want to tip them off too soon as to what's going on. Although now that we're saying this to this group, they're probably going to get tipped off. But anyway, we wanted to kind of keep it under the radar and a lot of us are working on a lot of different things at once. So, to raise it to the level of a social media campaign. Means that it's getting more serious and we're hoping to get this stopped before we get to that stage.

Barry: So, this letter was sent to Shamann, I believe this week and so Shamann really does need to sign on here.

Bradley: we sent it to him today.

Barry: And I know we have our critiques of him, but he's been fairly decent on stuff these days. So hopefully he'll just right away. If enough of you contact him and say, hey, we want you to sign the letter against the new planning department streamline development approval rules than that would be good. Put some pressure on him.

Dalila: Are there any other questions for Eric Bradley and Barry

Francisco: Yes, I have a statement, yesterday before the Board of Supervisors there was an issue on a building on Harrison Street 2300 or 2300 Harrison Street? So those who opposed, one they appeal, and it was sent back to the planning department. Something that hasn't happened in a long time. Then the issue was production distribution and repairs what is called PDR, but this is very important because if you look at parcel E-2 it has a lot of methane gas. and they have maintained valves which spill or release methane gas into the air and there are cracks underground is a raging fire right now and there are cracks on the ground and tell you they would use the could bypass using some language that it's okay for them to develop buildings using one word. It could even be associated with fracking in the sense that they can guess traveling to watch the Lou. I just want to bring that to the attention of those who called this and did the right thing. And as somebody else also mentioned, it could be applied to Treasure Island. So, thank you very much for your tenacity and fortitude.

Dalila: Any other comments or questions? For the last bit of this meeting. I just have an update with the air monitoring. I don't think I've given an update a bit ahead and share my screen. There's a couple things I just wanted to bring some things to this group's attention in terms of the air monitoring. I don't know if I updated this body on the site selection that we did in February before the you know, the pandemic, so our method for choosing sites in Bayview Hunters Point for the ten air monitors was to systemically split up Bayview into sections. We were trying to get a somewhat good geographical distribution to cover all of Bayview Hunters Point. And so, you can see that for over here. This is the BAAQMD reference site and we are currently in negotiations to actually put our air monitor there for colocation. So that's one. We've been working with the Southeast Community facility for a really long time. And thank you Edgar who is now not on the call, but he has really stepped up and took this on in place of Javier Padilla who did a lot of work with

me around getting an air monitor in the Southeast Community facility. These on the right are the original recommendations and target sights that the steering committee came up with. In all honesty we are in the recruitment phase, so we are actively recruiting some of these sites for them to host an air monitor. Because of covid-19 we have to shift the gears a bit for some of these locations. So, we are really looking to just kind of community network and figure out if there are private homes or residencies that would be open to hosting are monitors. So, if you know anybody definitely point them my way. This is what the air monitor should look like and I can absolutely send any information to anybody who is interested. So, we have the Dyls here. And then have a circuit board here. This the fan to keep the air monitor cool. This is the weather box, thats what they are in to protect against rain or even heat. Below, this is how it will work. So, the monitor will take raw sensor data temperature, humidity, and time. It will average that data put it on. There's two options, we really want it on a network which should be Ivan website and the on a server. For backup, let's say the network goes down. There is an SD card that will be connected with each air monitor to store the raw data. We are working with Tracking California to come up with a conversion equation so that the data can be more digestible for the masses. This is a look at what the air monitors look like when they're all put together. Another reason why I wanted to do this presentation and update is because we are still looking for an air technician. An air technician from the community is really vital to this project and I understand that with Covid-19 it's been really hard to get out in the community. As you know, I do not live in the community, but I am trying my best to stay connected. If you guys know anybody who is available for part-time job. The hours are very flexible. The pay is \$24 an hour. It will really be for troubleshooting and repairing the ten air monitors. Also performing routine maintenance for the air monitors and maintaining a regular log. This is very trainable this is very teachable. We will set up training. And yeah, I really really want to push getting an air technician, I think we are close to putting up the first air monitor. If you are interested in promoting this job announcement, let me know. I can send you the job announcement and if you could put it on your networks that would be amazing. That is my update is there any questions? Comments?

Leaotis: I think you're doing a good job. I'm proud of you.

Dalila: Thank you, Leaotis I appreciate it.

Anthony Khalil: Hey ya'll this is Anthony Khalil. I'm one of the members that serves on the community steering committee of the project and I have been enjoying many folks on this meeting who also serve. And you know, the only thing I can add to that, Dalila, is, you know, I just want to say that we've been able to flex, you know, in the covid era as you call it. This body has been aware of we've been giving you updates throughout the months and the fact that we've been able to be persistent with identifying the spots and understanding that even though that a lot of that identified areas are extremely impacted and can make no real decisions because its moment by moment. We're able to flex with that and I want to give a special nod to the fellow members that have been able to have connection that are in the neighborhood. Residents that are close or adjacent to the priority site. So it's just as good maybe even better time will tell and I'm glad that we, you know, when we hit a rock or we could just flow with it like water and I appreciate you know, that we have this body to give us a little bit more guidance and ask us questions and thats all I got to say so I'll pass it on.

Dalila: Did anybody else, we do have a couple steering committee members on the call. Does anyone have any additions to say about the air monitoring project?

Dr. Ahimsa: Well there is a point on the map. That black dot between f&h right in the center. Thats actually the location of the Cunningham family has a residence and they have agreed as private citizens to host an air monitor. So, we know that they are living in a very high-risk area. They have health effects, you know, they're comfortable with being public and again we could get one-sited there.

Dalila: Well, I know that its 3:50pm but that's all we had on the agenda. The next meeting will be September 16<sup>th</sup> it is a night meeting. For transparency, I will be pushing it up from 5 to 7 instead of 6 to 8 especially just because were still doing this virtual. I feel like it's not quite as necessary to have it that late. So, it'll be most likely 507 p.m. on September 16th. Does anybody have any last comments, questions? Resources, announcements anything like that? No, all right. What was that this meeting is adjourned. Thank you all for coming. I appreciate you all who show up every month. I know we're all busy and we're all doing amazing work. So, I really appreciate all of you and have a great night.