

Bayview Hunters Point Environmental Justice Response Task Force

Part of the IVAN (Identifying Violations Affecting Neighborhoods) Network:

www.bvhp-ivan.org

When: Wednesday, October 21st, 2020

Time: 2:00 p.m.- 4:00 p.m.

Location: Zoom- <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/89765840325>

Call in #: +1 (408) 638-0968

Meeting I.D: 897 6584 0325

AGENDA

2:00 PM	Welcome
2:10 PM	Community Announcements and Resources exchange
2:25 PM	IVAN Complaints
2:40 PM	“Penalty Regulations Rulemaking Project” Presentation by Abdalin Asinas (Department of Toxic Substances Control)
3:25 PM	“Supplemental Environmental Projects (SEP) Program” Presentation by California Air Resources Board
3:55 PM	Next Meeting Date and Time
4:00 PM	Meeting Adjourned

Welcome:

Dalila Adofo: And again, just to reassure everyone. This recording is just for note taking purposes. They will not be shared; it will not leave my laptop and I delete them after the minutes are taken. Welcome! We have some presentations this afternoon, and we will go ahead and get into community announcements and resources exchange and we will review the Ivan complaints since the last EJ Task Force meeting. And then we have Abdalin Asinas from Department of Toxic Substance Control to talk about penalty regulations rule making project. And then we have Helena from (CARB) California Air Resources Board, who will talk about supplemental environmental projects program. We'll do a Q&A discussion and that will be it for today. So again, thank you all for coming.

Dalila Adofo: This is the time to go ahead and announce any community announcements or covid resources exchange. It doesn't just have to be an environmental related thing could be anything that anybody would like to know or can any service that people could find useful.

Blair: I everyone just thought I would mention that, you know, a lot of folks are concerned about the election. And so there's a march rally, there'll be some speeches and some kind of music/entertainment. I'm not sure what exactly but bunch of organizations have organized, including the great Panthers and

occupy SF and some other folks. Including extinction rebellion and I work with them. But this is a, you know, March for democracy. I'm going to post the flyer to the chat. But it's this Saturday the 24th from 4:30 to 2PM and we're going to rally at mission high on you know. Drive across some Dolores Park and then March to San Francisco City Hall. Mask then distance, you know, nonviolent demonstrations.

Dalila Adofo: Great, thank you. Blair.

Dalila Adofo: IVAN complaints there was only one this month. And that was illegal dumping. So it says solid waste at 1875 marin street San Francisco west of the FedEx office is a large area of illegal dumping this is possibly encampment that is no longer inhabited. To the south there is scattered dumping.

Dalila Adofo: Getting into our first presentation. We have Abdalin Asinas from (DTSC) Department of Toxic Substance Control and Abdalin, you can go ahead and start.

AAsinas: Okay, thank you. Thank you for this chance to Dalila and to everyone here. So today I'm going to talk about our rulemaking project. It's about the administrative penalty regulations for hazardous waste control laws. So this is penalty regs for hazardous waste only.

AAsinas: So first, we're going to talk about the purpose of our outreach. I'll give you a brief background of our penalty regulations and then I'll go over the penalty assessment process. And then I'll provide some information on how to submit some comments. If you're interested in submitting comments or if you can distribute it to community members who are interested in submitting comments regarding these regulations. So the purpose of doing this outreach is to inform our stakeholders that we are in the process of possibly modifying or revising our current administrative penalties regulations so the regulations we use to assess our penalties. We are in the process of assessing it and possibly revising. Currently, we're in this process and gathering comments and opinions about the current regulations that we have and then we're going to gather alternatives that we could use in revising the regulations. And also get comments about these alternatives that we can use.

AAsinas: So this is the general rule making process. This is an illustration of how the process goes in and changing the regulations. So there's two phases. The pre-APA phase and the APA phase. APA stands for the Administrative Procedure Act. So we are currently in the pre APA phase. It's an informal process there's fireable time and that process includes getting the information that will be used to revise a regulation, if there are currently regulation available or to gather information that could go into the regulation. So we are in that stage. We are doing meetings and consultations. We're gathering information.

AAsinas: So let me give you a brief history of our regulations so that you will understand why we are we are thinking about revising the current regulations. So prior to 1997 DTSC assessed penalties based only on the laws found in the statutes. So there were no regulations for determining penalties. Pursuant to a Senate bill 523 there were temporary violations adopted on July 1, 1997 and permanent regulations were put in place on August 2001 and this is the current administrative penalty regulations is in Article three of

title 22 in the California Code of Regulations. And also, most recently there has been a statutory change of the maximum penalty that can be applied from 25,000 to 70,000 so the statutory maximum is the maximum amount that you can assess a penalty for one violation per day per violation. So it's previously less than 5000 now it's 70,000 in statutes, it was the statute distributor change happen in 2018 and emergency regulations in our article three that we use to assist penalties it was filed on July 2018 and it has become permanent on July 2019. So now we have that premier regulations that change the maximum penalty for 25,000 to 70,000.

AAsinas: So what are the penalty regulations? The penalty regulations I'm talking about is the administrative penalty regulations for assessing penalties for violations of hazardous waste control laws. So other bureaus departments and offices will have their own sets of regulations for determining penalties and this is separate from the penalty regulations I'm talking about right now so we're only concerned with hazardous waste control laws violations. It's located in Title 22 of the California code of regulations and these are the sections where it's at (Sections 66272.60 to 66272.69). And its based on law passed by the California legislature. Both found in health and safety code and government Code.

AAsinas: There are several statutes that our regulations are based on, but I'm going to talk about two of those statutes that are most important in going forward with this rulemaking project. The first is the basis or the factors that we should consider when we determine penalties. First is we need to determine the nature circumstances extent and seriousness of a violation. We need to also consider the efforts of the violator to prevent decrease or clean up the hazardous waste conditions that are posing a threat or danger to public health. And then consider the violators ability to pay. And then finally, we need to look at the prophylactic effect. So prophylactic effect is the ability of the penalty to discourage or deter future violations from occurring, both for the violator, as well as for the regulated community as a whole. And then the next statute is for the statutory maximum and as I've mentioned before this is important because very egregious violations can go very, very high. Because this statute step sets for maximum is four per day per violation. So if you have a violation is carrying many, many days the statutory much maximum can go very high. So right now it's it stands at 70,000 per day per violation.

AAsinas: So this is the flow chart of our process for determining penalties. I'm going to go over this process, and I'm going to use a simple case study for illustrating our process, but I have a disclaimer here that when we assess by reassess penalties. It's a case to case basis. So whatever I present here. Even if you have a similar case of that the penalty that will not that will be assessed will not be similar because they're always nuances and differences in each violation. Which case. So you cannot say that we determined at Palantir to be this case. In this example, you can say that it would be the same for a similar case. So this is a disclaimer that I want to mention because when we decide penalties it's always a case to case situation.

AAsinas: So let me start by going over the first step. The first step is to determine the potential for harm and extensive deviation. So these are the two factors we use to determine the initial penalty amount. So we determine the category for potential for harm as well as the category for extensive deviation. There are three for each factor. So once we determine which category for each factor we use that to determine

the initial penalty amount within the range in the penalty matrix. So, I will show you a little bit later how our penalty matrix looks like. And then once we have the initial penalty amount we adjust the initial penalty amount, based on the violators intent.

AAsinas: Okay, so let me go to my example. So this is the handout, the case study I was talking about. So I'm going to read the case study.

AAsinas: During a routine inspection by the Department of Toxic Substances Control of the Just-O-Kay (JOK) auto shop, inspectors have observed the rusty 55 gallon drum leaking used oil. The secondary containment. Just-O-Kay was in violation of hazardous waste control regulation for storing used oil. Which is considered hazardous in California in a container that is not in good condition. According to the hazardous waste label on the drum, the initial date of accumulation is 15 days prior to the day of inspection. So the violation has been occurring for 15 days. And these are all the factors that we need to look at. J. Okay, or the auto shop has the same violation, three years ago. It's located in industrial zone area. There are no schools, residents and large bodies of water nearby.

AAsinas: Let's determine the penalty. So starting with determining the potential for harm. For potential for harm, there are three categories major, moderate and minimal. And to determine potential for harm, we look at the six factors. So there are: characteristics of the substance involve, the amount of the substance involved and extent to which human life or health, animal life, environment and potable water supplies are threatened. So these are the six factors we need to consider when you determine either. It's my major moderate and minimal.

AAsinas: So if we look at the circumstances and the amount and different factors that we need to consider, the team (usually its a team with inspectors, supervisor, all the staff and other experts in certain type of violation) they assess the penalty and for this case, let's say that a minimal category was selected. I want to emphasize that the drum that was not in good condition was on top of a secondary containment so that limits any sort of harm that will happen because there's a secondary containment.

AAsinas: So next is determine the extent of deviation, the similar to potential for harm. There are three categories major, moderate and minimal. The extent of deviation is basically how much the violation deviated from the requirements. So for this case, it's minimal. And let me explain why. Let me go to the regulation. So these are the categories. So why is it minimal? For minimal definition, the act deviates somewhat from the requirement. The requirement functions nearly as intended, but not as well as if all provisions had been met. So for this case, you do have a drum that is not in good condition. However, it's on a secondary containment so that is the reason why you have that drum is to prevent any release. So, with only one drum that deviation is lowered already and plus the fact that you have a secondary containment and therefore the minimal extent of deviation. So now you have these two factors selected minimal and middle. Then the next part is to determine the initial penalty amount from the penalty matrix.

AAsinas: So this is the penalty matrix for our regulations with extensive deviation arranged in rows and the potential for harm are arranged in columns. Okay, so when we selected minimal and minimal for

extent of deviation and potential for harm the intersection of those two factors will select a range where we select the Initial penalty. So the range is that we will select our initial penalty amount is the lower right hand range. And that's from zero to \$5,600. The numbers in parenthesis are the mid range numbers. So, usually the team would select this number, however, based on the nuances of the potential for harm and extent deviation will probably go up to the upper limit or it could go down to the lower limit. So for this case for simplicity sake and time sake will select the mid range which is \$2,800. That's our initial penalty in \$2,800. And so let's go to the next step.

AAsinas: Next step is to adjust the initial penalty amount, based on the violators intent and to assess the violators intent, there are set of circumstances that we need to look at. It's on page 11 of hand out number one. That's this handout the number one is our actual Article three, which is the penalty regulations.

AAsinas: So based on the circumstances you will select the adjustment factor that can go to adjust the violators intent, it could go up to 100%. I mean, you could double the penalty for the initial penalty or it could go downward hundred percent, meaning the penalty could become zero, you know. And for this case the violation indicated neither good faith effort potential failure to comply, meaning they correspond to no adjustment factor. A, no adjustment factor means there's a zero adjustment. So if you use that in the equation here. If you put zero here, this whole thing will become zero and therefore your adjusted initial penalty amount will be the same as your initial penalty. So that will be 2800 as well. There are no adjustments. Okay, so let me go back to my PowerPoint.

AAsinas: So the fourth step is to increase the penalty amount based on economic benefit. So when we talk about the economic benefit here, we talk about the benefit to the violator, so the violator did something and there could probably benefit that violator when they did this violation so sometimes it does, and sometimes it did not. Okay. And then the next step is for multiple instances, but this is a discretionary step. So, for if it passes certain criteria which I will show to you a little bit later. For multiple violations, they can be assessed using a single penalty or there's also discretion to do single penalty for each instance. So the reason you do this is if you want to deprive the violator of economic benefit. Or if you want, another reason is probably prophylactic effect, but it's not directly mentioned in the regulation, but it's one of the possible reasons that you could assess single penalty for each item for each violation or you can assess a single penalty for all of the violations.

AAsinas: And then the the six step is to calculate a multiday component. Multiday component is only applicable if you have a violation that occurred for more than one day. So, and it can be calculated with this equation, you multiply the initial penalty times 2% times the number of days after the first day with of the violation.

AAsinas: So let me go back to my example.

AAsinas: So I talked about economic benefit. So for this case. For this example, there was very minimal economic benefit because they have available personnel and there was only one drum and they already have the 55 gallon drum. It's available to contain so it's it's probably

AAsinas: Something that they could have easily

AAsinas: They could have easily corrected this violation, but for some reason they haven't. So let's say that there's minimal or zero.

AAsinas: economic benefit and if this is the case for DTS, we have minimum of 500 if it

AAsinas: Doesn't go above 500 we will not include that in the penalty. However, the certified unified program agencies or Cooper's are not bound to this.

AAsinas: To this policy so they could probably assess

AAsinas: economic benefit below \$500

AAsinas: Okay, next is the multiple instances. So for our example, we only have one instance and with this step does not apply. However, I want to point out the criteria that you can use. So there are three here, you can use

AAsinas: To if you want to set a single penalty or otherwise. And one of the example, or one of the criteria, you can use is if the facility violated the same requirement, some

AAsinas: Meaning the same violation in one or more locations within the facility. So, for example, for our example here, if they did the same violation, but for different areas in the facility, then you could probably assess one

AAsinas: One penalty for all of the violations or if you want. If you want to assess a higher penalty good assess

AAsinas: A penalty for each of those violations.

AAsinas: This is a discretion is that percentage

AAsinas: Yeah, and then

AAsinas: Let's go to number seven. This is for the continuum violation. So multi day component can be or will be calculated. If you have a violation that occurred for more than one day.

14156370075: So for our example in the code.

AAsinas: For 15 days, based on the label. And so we can assess this multi component. So, so, so what we have is 2800 is the initial amount

AAsinas: And then multiply by point 02 or the 2% times 14 because we don't count the first day. And that's point 02 times 14 is point 28 so multiply that to the net adjusted initial penalty and get \$784 that's your multiplayer component

AAsinas: So once we have the multiplayer component we can calculate the base penalty, the base penalty would be adding all the

AAsinas: This

AAsinas: This elements, the adjusted initial penalty economic benefit and the multimedia component. So let me go back to my PowerPoint.

AAsinas: Sorry you share our point

AAsinas: So I mentioned the base penalty calculation. And then if you have several violations, you can calculate the total based penalty, which is

AAsinas: The sum of all of the base penalties for all of the violations. And then the last step, which is not the least, because you have

AAsinas: four factors to adjust the total base penalty and the four factors are cooperation prophylactic effect compliance history and ability to pay. And the way you adjust the Toby's penalty is the calculation is very similar to the calculation for intent. Okay, so

AAsinas: Let me just go back to

AAsinas: So, for

AAsinas: The bass penalty we we add the adjusted initial penalty economic benefit and multiplayer component. And that comes to

AAsinas: 3584

AAsinas: And then the total base penalty. Since we only have one violation, same number.

AAsinas: And then we use that to calculate our

14156370075: Our final penalty.

AAsinas: So the final penalty needs to be

AAsinas: adjusted to cooperation prophylactic effect of points. History inability to pay. So let me touch on cooperation, so you will see some of the factors we considered for cooperation.

AAsinas: So this is for cooperation.

AAsinas: It can go the factors is downward adjustment of up to 25%

AAsinas: If there's an extraordinary effort.

AAsinas: So a circumstances violated violator exceeded the minimum requirement and returning to compliance, so they can have sort of

AAsinas: You know discount on their penalty if they exerted an extraordinary, extraordinary you know about what's required to go back into compliance. That's for cooperation.

AAsinas: And then prophylactic effect. There's not much information about prophylactic effect only that

AAsinas: That

AAsinas: It says here that the penalty is sufficient to provide prophylactic effect on both the violator, and the regulated community.

AAsinas: Now for compliance history there are specific items. So one of them is

AAsinas: Let me mention 50% may be granted if the violator has a current internal international organization standard or an ISO 14,001 certificates, so

AAsinas: That's this one of the things that they're looking for. However, another one is, it can also be increased if the violator demonstrated a history of non compliance or of over the for the past five years. So you can go up to 100% so it can double the panel penalty.

AAsinas: And lastly ability to pay. So for DTS for ability to pay. We have a

AAsinas: standard procedure, we're in. We are requiring the facility to provide financial documents and our financial unit will review their required financial documents and then they will assess whether the that facility will be able to pay the penalty that was set

AAsinas: During the assessment process. So it's more instead of we do this during your assessment, it's, it's done after there's contact with the violator after we told them about the penalty that thing to pay because they need to send us those documents.

AAsinas: So,

AAsinas: Go back to my

AAsinas: So that's the process.

AAsinas: And then I also like to touch on

Very

AAsinas: Like to go to the next, next one.

AAsinas: So I'd like to touch on some alternatives to the penalty matrix.

AAsinas: Some of the alternatives that we are thinking about is having set fines for frequently answer violations. So example of this are sort of the field orders that we used to use and etc. One of the rationale of having this feel

AAsinas: You know having set points is to streamline the process because the penalty termination process for us.

AAsinas: does take a long time takes a

AAsinas: Large amount of time for for enforcement staff as well as for the regulated community. So having field orders for common violations.

AAsinas: The rationale is that we will be able to streamline the process. Another alternative and a good, you know, been mix and match with the other alternative that we have is having two or more separate penalty matrices and the rationale for this is that since

AAsinas: It's having using this current this penalty regulations. There had been changing. So one of the changes is that we have this increase of our statutory maximum and prior to that in 2009 we have

AAsinas: You know the Erase the universal waste.

AAsinas: Regulations. So now we have a new

AAsinas: New

AAsinas: waste, waste stream that are lower in potential for harm and yet we still use the same penalty matrix that we use for, you know, more hazardous waste and so sometimes when we assess penalties.

AAsinas: This we are having a hard time determining

AAsinas: Proper penalty for lower potential harm and

AAsinas: waste streams, such as a universal waste.

AAsinas: And then the third one is using a penalty matrix that is weighted toward potential for harm. So if we go back to our matrix here.

AAsinas: It is a very

AAsinas: The potential for harm and extensive deviation has sort of a mirroring effect. So here the minimal major is the same as the

AAsinas: Major minimum for a penalty matrix. This waited for potential for harm. What you'll see is that there's more emphasis on potential for harm, meaning

AAsinas: As the potential for harm increases the the penalty will greatly increase. So the but the statutory maximum will still be the same, only that it's not a mirror, you will not see this kind of mirroring of both potential center deviation

AAsinas: And with that.

AAsinas: I'd like to

AAsinas: Conclude with

AAsinas: This information and how to send comments.

AAsinas: We have have provided the handout. Number three, we have guide questions there that you can use to

14156370075: Send your comments.

AAsinas: To

AAsinas: You know, to write your comments and then you can submit those comments by email to this email address bounty regs that the CSC ca.gov would really appreciate it if they're certified certified program agency staff that are attending this

AAsinas: This

AAsinas: Meeting, as well as community members and we really appreciate your input regarding this matter, I'll be done outreach to other Ivan boobs and

AAsinas: We have gathered information and also during this meeting after my talk.

AAsinas: I

AAsinas: Welcome you some comments. If there are

AAsinas: Questions and comments.

AAsinas: I'd be happy to answer them. If, if I can.

AAsinas: Thank you very much.

AAsinas: And if there are questions, I'd be happy to answer.

Dalila Adofo: People can also

Dalila Adofo: Ask questions in the chat. I'll be monitoring the chat.

AAsinas: I'll stop sharing

14156840155: Hello. Hi.

14156840155: Ya hear me, yes.

All right.

14156840155: I heard everything I was saying, but it's really hard to to understand in the sea would be talking about is, it's a person don't have zoom and there's

14156840155: Probably there's other people probably there's only phone like maybe journey. I don't know. Because, uh, I called in about five years, something like that, but backing really the mistakes. Did I know they Canaan.

14156840155: Yes.

AAsinas: We do have

14156840155: We do have, if you have an email, we could

AAsinas: Lena could probably forward to you the handouts and we have in the handouts. We have the FAQs.

14156840155: So that my presentation is over.

AAsinas: There.

AAsinas: So all of the handouts and

14156840155: Who are. Who am I going to

14156840155: Say,

AAsinas: My name is Abdullah Enos Enos, I'm in the Department of Toxic Substances Control.

AAsinas: And I just

AAsinas: Did it right now. The

14156840155: Project

AAsinas: But the Nina I forwarded

Handouts to Lena

14156840155: I do have a question. When is these, uh, these

14156840155: People that valley these companies going to actually

14156840155: Give cited and get tickets and stuff like this. When is the things going to actually occur because we've been talking about this stuff, but

14156840155: You know, every now and then something happened. But then after that a Go Zone alone can don't let them know sadness, you know, we have people that we won't be people that really do you know the new right you have to stay home. Right.

AAsinas: So, as far as I know, sir, we, we do.

AAsinas: Use our current penalty regulations. Right now, we use a penalty regulations and we do

AAsinas: Assessed penalties for

AAsinas: For all the violations.

AAsinas: But tell me,

14156840155: We have classes for

AAsinas: The violation. We have a class.

14156840155: Minor violation.

AAsinas: Of class two.

14156840155: And a class one, so

AAsinas: The most egregious one or the class once

14156840155: And then followed by the class two, and then

AAsinas: Minor. As the name suggests it's minor so only the class once and some class tools that occur.

14156840155: Together with the class ones are assessed.

AAsinas: So,

14156840155: Yeah, and also the TSA are not the only ones that are assessing

AAsinas: Penalties the certified in five program agencies. They are the local, local groups.

14156840155: Not groups local agencies that says

14156840155: Conductance actions.

14156840155: Okay, this

14156840155: Is the multi day factor only 2%

Dalila Adofo: Given that this could make penalties for a

Dalila Adofo: Calculated decision to allow a violation to continue

Dalila Adofo: Much less onerous

14156840155: So that's, that's

AAsinas: Thank you for that comment. So as I mentioned, these are one of the things that we are asking people is 2% enough, especially if you have very we just violations that you know if you could

AAsinas: If you think about it, maybe they should be hundred percent instead of 2% so when they did this regulation, they decide on a 2% so that's why we're on 2% so that's that's all I can.

AAsinas: You know, share right now, but I will come the comment that that if you have bridges violations probably 2% is not enough.

Dalila Adofo: Does anyone have any other questions, comments for Abdullah

14156370075: Yes, I'm hide. It's just really with

14156370075: Mothers and fathers and green action. I had a quick question. How does the information related to the public, like let's say a company gets cited or find

14156370075: Any information related to the public or the neighbors are that they're violating or there's just kind of just between your agency and the company.

AAsinas: As far as I know, if there are

AAsinas: There are penalties that are paid. They are posted on our

AAsinas: On our website and they're all supposed to be in

AAsinas: Like you know

AAsinas: Like Twitter.

AAsinas: social networking sites. So, as far as I know that's that's how to do it.

AAsinas: Using our, our communications.

AAsinas: Efforts, etc. So we do when we assess bounty says how we we inform the public that we

AAsinas: Assess penalties. Usually, this happens when they already paid the penalty.

AAsinas: Does that answer your question.

14156370075: A little bit lazy. You're saying it's like announced on Twitter or something like a maybe a bar.

AAsinas: Yeah, something it's on our website and then different

14156840155: Social

14156370075: Okay.

AAsinas: Like face.

14156840155: Yes, sir. Hello. Hello.

14156840155: Yes, I can.

14156840155: Yeah, this Leo.

14156840155: What about Darlene international

14156840155: Darlene. They you and we around there, they stink so bad. I mean, just walk, you know, with a good now under the vein body, you know, right there. Why, why came doesn't be done about that.

AAsinas: So,

14156840155: I cannot

AAsinas: Speak for specific

AAsinas: Cases.

AAsinas: So because

14156840155: For one, I don't know if it's messy case.

AAsinas: Or to be one of the counties, however.

AAsinas: I would like to mention that

AAsinas: There is

AAsinas: The calorie theory. So

AAsinas: DCS, you have a complaint hotline.

14156840155: We accept any complaints and

AAsinas: After that those will be

14156840155: triage and

AAsinas: Depending on who

AAsinas: It was

AAsinas: Then

AAsinas: inspectors will go there and

14156840155: Conduct inspections.

14156840155: And okay, but I have another question. And I have another question. Why, why, when people license expired. They did we talk about companies.

14156840155: They license expired and got the license renewed the keep doing what they doing, but yet they keep doing it.

14156840155: Several years and that's not right. Because if I got a driver's license and expires and the police pulled me over. He gonna give me a ticket are told my car probably take me to jail. So that's not right.

14156840155: I don't feel that these companies.

14156840155: I don't feel that these companies that that don't take care of the business to have a certification is right.

14156840155: after that date when expired as money should be shut down that stay for that nobody else's fault that's painful for not taking care they business.

14156840155: And we need to get ya need to get strict on these people, they have plenty enough time. They know the expiration date, let them hang on a minute, like everybody else supposed to handle that been it. Don't be leaning on them and let them keep working.

14156840155: run a business as business as usual, because it's not business as usual.

AAsinas: Okay, Julie, know that

14156840155: Sir, thank you.

Dalila Adofo: To our next presenter.

Dalila Adofo: Okay, thank you.

14156840155: Dylan.

AAsinas: Thank you. Thank you.

Dalila Adofo: And then we will go ahead and move on to our other

Dalila Adofo: Center from cow.

Dalila Adofo: Air resources.

Dalila Adofo: I'm speaking on

Dalila Adofo: Projects.

14156840155: Hey, can you hear me.

14156840155: Yes. Awesome. Let me share my screen real quick.

Dalila Adofo: And again, for those who aren't speaking, please put your phone or computer on mute.

Helena Rhim: Can you guys see my screen.

Dalila Adofo: Yes.

Helena Rhim: Awesome, thank you to Lila, and everyone for letting us are giving us opportunity to share a little bit about the supplemental environmental product or sub program.

Helena Rhim: My name is Helen rim and I'm in the community outreach enforcement section of excuse me carbs enforcement division and today I'll provide a quick overview of the program provide some examples of the different types of projects and go over the general funding and application process.

Helena Rhim: So what is a supplemental environmental project or Sep subs are community based projects funded from a portion of penalties received during the settlement of enforcement options.

Helena Rhim: More specifically carb has a policy that allows violators of carbs rules and regulations to use up to 50% of their panel of their settlement penalties to fund a project.

14156370075: The set program.

Helena Rhim: aims to improve public health reduce air pollution increase environmental compliance and bring public awareness to communities. Most burdened by environmental harm.

Helena Rhim: And what's really great is that anyone can submit a set proposal so community based organizations nonprofits tribal governments.

Helena Rhim: Agencies, etc. Can all apply to receive some funding through this program just as long as the proposed project aligns with the program schools and the set policy, which I will go over next

Helena Rhim: And as a quick snapshot of the program since 2017 over \$16 million in funding has been committed to sub projects and we've had a total of 42 projects funded so far.

Helena Rhim: So the set policy guides our process for reviewing and approving proposals to include in our list of available projects for violators to choose from.

Helena Rhim: So the policy states that sub projects must meet the criteria listed here and that will outline in order to be eligible eligible for funding.

Helena Rhim: So a project must reduce or prevent emissions or reduce the public's exposure to emissions, it must improve the environment, which is pretty broadly defined

Helena Rhim: It must have a connection to the violation through the location or the pollutant at hand, it must not benefit the violator, it must go beyond federal, state, and local requirements and it must be technically economically and legally feasible.

Helena Rhim: So how do products actually get funding through the sub program. There's a lot of work that goes behind each of the steps that I'll share but um I'll just provide a higher level overview

Helena Rhim: So first, when there is a settlement between carb and the violating entity, a carb case investigator will

Helena Rhim: List or

Helena Rhim: will present the list of available set projects for the violator to choose from, if they choose to fund us up in lieu of a portion of their penalty payment.

Helena Rhim: And if they do, they can choose to either fully fund or partially fund a sub project of their choice. And if a product is just partially funded it remains on the available projects list for any future violators to choose from and the budget is just updated to reflect the remaining amount

Helena Rhim: Then while the investigator prepares the settlement agreement for the violator, and for carb to review and sign the sub team prepares the sub oversight agreement which outlines the requirements of this program for the funding recipient and for carb to review and sign

Helena Rhim: Then once both the settlement agreement and the sub oversight of agreement are fully executed the violator sends the setup funds directly to the recipient and as soon as funds are dispersed the separate SIP lan is expected to start implementing the project and sharing progress reports.

Helena Rhim: And I know this is a lot, but the only thing that you really have to worry about as the sub recipient is reviewing the SEC oversight agreement implementing the project. Once you receive the funds and following our reporting guidelines, which I'll go over in a little bit.

Helena Rhim: I also want to make it clear that once a project is approved and included in the list of available sub projects.

Helena Rhim: Funding isn't guaranteed right away or within a specific time frame because this is a voluntary program for violators who may or may not choose to fund a sub as part of their settlement. But as you saw in their first slide we have

Helena Rhim: Over \$16 million committed in sub funding and 42 projects funded so far. And I think the only ones that are just partially funded or haven't been funded yet are the ones that we approved just this June in 2020

Helena Rhim: Okay, so now I'm going to go into the different types of projects that are

Helena Rhim: Eligible for the sub program and examples of current or previous steps under each project type. So, first there's pollution prevention or reduction.

Helena Rhim: These projects aim to prevent exposure to or end or reduce air pollution or greenhouse gas emissions that contribute to climate change and an example would be the installation of high high performance.

Helena Rhim: air filtration systems and schools within communities that are most impacted by air pollution.

Helena Rhim: There's also environmental restoration. Oops.

Helena Rhim: environmental restoration and protection projects that aim to improve or restore the quality of the environment.

Helena Rhim: And an example of that would be a program that encourages ocean going vessels to reduce their speed and the slower mission levels and reduce the risk of fatal ship strikes to wildlife in the area.

Helena Rhim: There's also environmental education or compliance training. Sorry to stop doing that.

Helena Rhim: which aims to improve or restore the quality of the environment and this could be a youth, education program that teaches students about monitoring and improving air quality in their communities.

Helena Rhim: There are community monitoring projects that provide tools such as surveillance and monitoring equipment and monitoring or and

Helena Rhim: It could be used by train members of the public for data acquisition and enhancement of existing air quality monitoring stations.

Helena Rhim: And the example is a community based air monitoring and modeling slash outreach project to inform resonance about the air quality issues in their own communities.

Helena Rhim: We also allow for trans boundary projects, but I don't unfortunately have an example of this, because we haven't had a project like this. Yet in the sub program.

Helena Rhim: But the purpose would be to provide a direct benefit to California and in and around the border environment with other States and Mexico.

Helena Rhim: And then there are other projects that really that don't really fit into any of these categories, but they might still be considered if they are consistent with the sub requirements and the sub policy.

Helena Rhim: And from the examples I outlined, you can see that some projects fall under one under more than one category. And that's perfectly fine. Just as long as project aligns with the set program goals.

Helena Rhim: And this means that you can really be creative with your proposal to make it best fit the needs of your community.

Helena Rhim: And there's actually been to sub projects in the Bayview hunters point community that you guys might be familiar with.

Helena Rhim: One is the community diesel education and emissions project or deep that focused on reducing diesel idling through education and outreach.

Helena Rhim: And the other one is called the particulate matter or PM sensor network that aimed to install monitoring sensors in the community and share out the air quality data with the community. And both of these projects were in 2018

Helena Rhim: also mentioned that many labs, whose was the sub recipient for the PM sensor network also has an approved project and the available subs list.

Helena Rhim: To build on existing on the existing sensor network and this project hasn't been selected for funded yet but funding yet, but it would essentially be like a phase two of this sensor network project. Once it is

Helena Rhim: And if you're interested in submitting a set proposal. These are the basic proposal elements that are required to deem the proposal complete

Helena Rhim: So basic things like organization name, description project scope budget timeline and if you have any contractors or partners, including any support letters from them and making sure that you have a scope of their responsibilities as the partners on the project.

Helena Rhim: And I'll note that there isn't a limit on the project budget or timeline, but of course it would make sense and align with the scope of the proposed project and the sub team is more than happy to walk you through

Helena Rhim: The proposal process to make sure all these elements are completed, and that we can recommend the project for approval to be added to our available subs list.

Helena Rhim: So then what is the actual process for submitting a proposal for potential sub funding. Once you've brainstormed a great product idea for your community.

Helena Rhim: There are two ways you can submit a completed proposal, you can do it online, on the EPA website or email directly to one of our sub team members.

Helena Rhim: And we actually highly recommend that you just submit the proposal directly to us via email, just so we can

Helena Rhim: minimize any lag time in obtaining the proposal from Kelly EPA and if you're interested, we can provide a syllable PDF of the proposal forms, so that you can fill that out and email it back to us.

Helena Rhim: And then once we receive your proposal and review it to ensure that all of the elements. We talked about are included.

Helena Rhim: And the proposed project aligns with the set program goals, then the sub team either recommends the proposal for approval by the carb executive office or will reach back out to you to make sure that your proposal is complete and aligns better with our program.

Helena Rhim: Then once the project is added to the list of available steps, your project may be selected by a violator during a settlement of enforcement action which point we will notify you of the potential funding and then go through that funding process that I went over in the previous slide.

Helena Rhim: So once you

Helena Rhim: You know, get your proposal approved and you get your funding.

Helena Rhim: And you get started with implementation, the separate sippy is required to provide quarterly. And finally, our final reports on their progress and final results.

Helena Rhim: Of the project so quarterly reports have to include key activities and results during the reporting period and expenditure reports that match the proposed budget.

Helena Rhim: And the final report must include a narrative of the successes challenges and benefits of implementing the project and a qualitative and quantitative evaluation of project objectives and outcomes.

Helena Rhim: And within the sub oversight agreement that I mentioned in the funding process. We provide detailed guidelines on what we expect from both types of projects and this information is also on this up web page. If you want to check it out. And I'll have the link and the final slide.

Helena Rhim: Okay, so now that all of you know all the general ins and outs of the set program you can visit this website here to submit your proposal online or you can contact us at our general step email to learn more about the program or to brainstorm ideas.

Helena Rhim: Or ask us any questions that you have. And again, we recommend that you work directly with us to work on the proposal and submitted to us via email.

Helena Rhim: And it's important to note that there are no deadlines to submit a proposal, but the proposals are typically reviewed and approved by carb on a quarterly basis.

Helena Rhim: So that was a lot of information.

Helena Rhim: spewed out you pretty quickly. So we're more than happy to talk through the program and proposal process with you again directly if you're interested in applying for potential step funding.

Helena Rhim: And on the screen here you'll see the sub teams contact information. Me, Linda, do warn Hawkins our manager.

Helena Rhim: And the SEP homepage that has the same overview of the program that's a policy and a list of currently available sub projects that by leaders can choose from. If you want to look at what

Helena Rhim: Others have proposed, and what's been approved. So if you have a project idea for your community, please let us know Eric Bissinger who's also on this call.

Helena Rhim: And on and on our team always participates in these meetings so you can always reach out to him, or you can reach out to any one of us in the community outreach and enforcement section. And that's it. Thank you.

Helena Rhim: Oh, and please let me know if you have any questions.

Dalila Adofo: All right, we have a question in the chat is there community participation and the decision making process about approving set projects.

Helena Rhim: In the approval know we have. So we worked with the community and they are the community member, whoever is applying for the setup.

Helena Rhim: writes the proposal and the idea for who they want involved and what the scope of the project will be and then we help make sure that that aligns the policy, the set program and then it's approved by the car executive office. So that's sort of the flow of

Helena Rhim: Decisions and approval for the proposals.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: A little bit because I'm real step. Okay.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Why did above the violator decides to what product to fund that stated in the policy and

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: There are, if you want to visit the policy will be easier to understand there's certain criteria and Helen imagine it.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: It has to be there has to be an access to the pollutant into the locations. So it's not free to them. We like to a list, we have the general list and then wants the investigator that's

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Leading the case reaches back to us intercepting we try to give them like a shorter list on the projects that would fit the case that he's working with her, she is working with

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: So it's not really like open for them to decide. Sometimes the the violators Florida responsible parts they operate statewide

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: So that opens more the lives and we just provide the whole thing. But if there is there like any specific concerns. I see that

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: There's like a corrupt route of corruption is what I see here. Maybe you can elaborate a little bit more because like this process is like, since we receive the proposal.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: We have a lot of stuff within carved assembled in the process of defining if the, if it's feasible to be implemented and it goes to the executive officer and

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: For the selection through the RP, it's, it's up to them to decide if they want to participate in the program, but the project that they select we are involved in the process.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Car from forsman so it's not that I hope that answers your question. And if you have like burger. You want to have a further discussion will always free I'm

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Happy to help you and we love to have these conversations with community groups. So now, submit

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: A proposal or that are interested in the program because we know that these like really broad information, but having a separate conversation and going over those little details that are within the whole the mental process and the funding process, they're important.

CARB/Eric Bissinger: Yeah. Hi, this is Eric

CARB/Eric Bissinger: The also when when we're going through the penalty process. We do look at that question about whether you know where the violation occurred. And if there's a step.

CARB/Eric Bissinger: Project in that area. We will suggest we will show them like, okay, there's this, you know, and also on top of that they're not allowed to use

CARB/Eric Bissinger: The, you know, the funding, they're not allowed to use it as a PR like

CARB/Eric Bissinger: Project either like once they find it, they can't go around and be like, look at all this good stuff. We done

Helena Rhim: Yeah, we have specific language in the settlement agreements that clearly says that the project cannot be used for the violators benefit or for PR purposes and the proposal when it's written and implemented by whoever submitted the proposal.

Helena Rhim: They get to decide who's involved in the project and the proposal writing process and

Helena Rhim: work directly with us and the violator only comes into the picture when they're entering the settlement agreement with carb and they have

Helena Rhim: A choice to just use up to 50% of their penalty fee which they have to pay. Either way to choose one of the projects that have been approved by us but but that have been, you know, developed by that community or whoever is working with them for that community. So, that makes sense.

CARB/Eric Bissinger: This is Eric again. So, I mean, the, what I'd like to you guys that have a takeaway for this. This presentation is if you can think of any projects.

CARB/Eric Bissinger: That you have ideas about a bit brainstorming about that need funding and your community. You know, we can help you put a proposal together to help get funding for that project.

Dalila Adofo: Is of projects.

CARB/Eric Bissinger: I mean, for example, we have the

CARB/Eric Bissinger: You know the monitoring program that's

CARB/Eric Bissinger: Going on, now.

Dalila Adofo: I don't mean to step outside of my facilitation role.

Dalila Adofo: Um, but I actually did want to talk a little bit about the air monitoring.

Dalila Adofo: Set that was done in 2018 that is being renewed and

Dalila Adofo: I've been working on, you know, the air monitoring and

Dalila Adofo: You know,

Dalila Adofo: If you, if you know about it. Um, but I've been working on the Murray Harrison air mining project and I haven't. I actually hadn't heard of them any labs.

Dalila Adofo: Air sensors. And I was just wondering

Dalila Adofo: You know installation of 30 is that

Dalila Adofo: You know, is that still up and functional what network is that on. I would love to.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Yes, we actually have Rebecca Skinner local Rebecca, you want to jump in.

Rebecca E. Skinner: Oh, yes, yes. Hi. We've in sweep installed about I think it's like 15 we had, um, I have I have several my several of them myself, which I can

Rebecca E. Skinner: Which I can install and at, at, you know, many, many of the Bayview hunters point Environmental Justice Task Force meetings in the past two or three years I've

Rebecca E. Skinner: Brought up the project. And since we were were funded originally in October 2018 I pointed out, you know, said to people. I have monitors and I would love to.

Rebecca E. Skinner: Put more monitors in the Bayview hunters point, especially

Rebecca E. Skinner: Let's say south of the of the Oakdale of Oakdale and Third Street would be would be x. Excellent. So we, we still still have have monitors and I I installed one at mendell and Hudson.

Rebecca E. Skinner: I'm about three about Labor Day and would be an end, please contact me if you if you want want one in your neighborhood, and I will, I will be happy to come by. Yeah.

Dalila Adofo: Okay, sorry, Rebecca. I didn't put

Rebecca E. Skinner: Each other.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: But that's fine. I like it just on the call. I just forgot to mention that she she's lived many lives and they are the recipients for the

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Project, and I know it's been challenging and I'd like to recognize that she's been in like always, they're

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Responding to the request for any reports and clarification on the implementation of the project. So it's good that she's here actually

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Searching chicken share, probably. I mean, I remember that we have these like long conversation all the setbacks and they are in concert and implementation. But yeah, it's challenging, but it's rewarding and it's good that

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: It, regardless of those obstacles, community groups are still willing to participate and we appreciate that.

Rebecca E. Skinner: Okay, thank you very much.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Thank you.

Dalila Adofo: Yeah, sorry about that. I feel so bad.

Sorry.

Dalila Adofo: Any other questions, comments.

14156840155: Yeah well comment. I think I'm doing a very good job. I appreciate it very much.

Helena Rhim: Thank you. We appreciate it.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Thank you.

Dalila Adofo: Okay.

14156840155: With

Dalila Adofo: That. Thank you.

Dalila Adofo: Very much. Um, Helena and Linda and Eric

Dalila Adofo: absolutely appreciate you sharing the set program with this.

Dalila Adofo: With the EJ task force.

Helena Rhim: No problem. Thank you.

CARB/Eric Bissinger: Yeah, hopefully you do find some programs. Yes.

Helena Rhim: Yes, please reach out to us if you have any ideas.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Thank you.

Dalila Adofo: And, um, do you mind if I share this presentation with

Dalila Adofo: Like when I send out the Minutes and stuff like that.

CARB/Eric Bissinger: If you use make it a PDF. That'd be all I'll send you the PDF

Dalila Adofo: Okay, thank you. Thank you.

Dalila Adofo: Great. So now we're going to have

Dalila Adofo: An update on buyer monitoring with odd. So you can go

Dalila Adofo: You can go

Dalila Adofo: Just before she starts. We are going to have just two quick updates via monitoring and

Dalila Adofo: There was a request for an update on the south east treatment plan. So we'll have a quick update on that as well. That is not on the agenda, but we, we've got some time so

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Is it showing up with him.

Dalila Adofo: Yes.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Perfect. Awesome. My name is William um and I am biomedical scientists, I finished my PhD at UCSF last year where I studied

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Real nutrients metabolites and environmental factors and physiology and I'm currently a second year medical student at UCSF.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And I'll be working more closely with Dr seem chai, and each P 500 and program this year. So I'm super happy to be able to present today and give you an update on the program and some of the findings of the clinic from its inaugural year and then some of our plans for this year.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): By monitoring program was launched in January 2019 through collaboration community scientists led by Dr. Hymns assume chai. Dr. Amanda Tesco.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Interactions and number of others. And in addition to partnerships with academic researchers from UCSF and San Francisco State.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And the program has launched as the nation's first initiative designed to detect the body burden of environmental toxins and radionuclides for residents living adjacent to the Federal Superfund site.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And body burn is a term used by by environmental scientist describe the total accumulation of toxins in bodies of people

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): The clinic was funded by the Lucile Packard Foundation and October 2013 was fully licensed by the medical board California in January 2020

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And the before I Ching goal of the program is to really establish a cosmic direct relationship between environmental exposures and expressions of disease amongst exposed community members.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Um, and so

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): As as

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): It's familiar to this audience and the Bay Area monitoring our Air Quality Management District report card found that air pollution babysitters pointing to the 80th percentile, particularly, it's kind of an oxide.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): nitrogen oxide quality or getting components and then the 90th percentile for sulfur.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And particularly matters is broadly defined as any mixture of soil liquid droplets suspended in the air that's made up of states, we're going to come at gold medals soil dust allergens.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): In the case of the shipyard and radiation from contaminated soils that are moved during remediation efforts or construction trade spend volatiles in the air and

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Written by by community members and the World Health Organization recommends its air pollution as a carcinogen and it's the leading cause of lung cancer among them non smokers.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And exposures to particulates has also been directly linked to hypertension, heart attack pediatric and adult asthma congestive heart failure and preterm birth, all these conditions are health disparities in the Bayview hunters point community were infant mortality rates.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Increased from 12.5 per thousand life through to 15 across all ethnic groups.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And so by monitoring as a research tool that allows the measurement of chemicals and metabolites been bodies by analyzing samples of blood tissue urine and hair.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Or breast milk using mass spectrometry, and it provides a critical missing link between toxins in the exposures and bodies allows us to sort of to draw sort of lead to why diseases manifesting

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And so the clinic really sort of our catchphrases detect protect and prevent and so we hope to establish

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Advanced environment of public health efforts through the establishment of a voluntary toxic registry and hazard mapping surveillance system. And so, the system will allow us to optimize the early detection of diseases that are

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Going to environmental occupational exposures will also allow us to optimize nutrition and lifestyle changes to prevent and mitigate the expression of toxic environment. This is, as well as optimized access and lead people to further high quality care.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And the methodology is based on a simple low cost your analysis conducted by Genova diagnostic testing. So individuals will give us a urine sample and we'll send it to this diagnostic testing company that will run comprehensive mass spec.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And this panel of testing allows us to detect 35 toxic elements and nutrients, including like many of the major toxic metals and read uniquely is that are known to be present at the ship art and upon submission of these tests, we can get a turnaround in about a week's time

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And so in our first year, and we're

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Able to test about 30 people, half of which were from our current or former workers of UCSF and will Connie and submitted urine samples for analysis and almost all participants were found to have high body burdens of toxic metals.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Like manganese arsenic and fanatic.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And these elements are known to be present in the ship Heartland and

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Indicated by maybe records manganese is a naturally occurring heavy metal that's associated to mining and industrial activities and it's been almost universe. It's been University detected in high normal to toxic concentration and screens performed to date.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And there's a growing body of literature linking toxic exposures to manganese to damage to immune organs and also coming up in our paneling is

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Reactive or toxic levels of uranium, which is known to be present a partial he looked on the south east side of the UCSF em all colony.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And just to take a kind of deep closer look at sort of what we're able to gain tell from this data and kind of wanted to look at an example case. And so this is a scheming

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Panel from a 40 year old Hunters Point resident and shipyard worker been working for about 20 years. And as we can note from this these results.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Individual was found to have high to normal levels of magnesium nickel and fanatic. I'm as well as radioactive cesium in

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Concentration is exceeding the normal reference range. And what's really interesting and very sort of illuminating. And this time of

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Of global pandemic is this testing also allows us, in addition to the radioactive heavy metals and we do nucleotides. It allows us to detect

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Essential Nutrients and CO factors that are essential for the functioning for that that proper functioning of endocrine know muscular and the immune system and what's emerging from this preliminary pilot year is a

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Doctor Satan tries to entitle the toxic triangle deficiencies.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Of micronutrients that are essential for the optimal functioning of the immune system in our endocrine system, including the thyroid gland and and these factors are zinc selenium and copper so copper, for example, copper deficiencies have been linked to increase susceptibility of infections.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): As it's involved in the immune systems role in fighting infection repairing damaged tissue and we try using free radicals that damage ourselves.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And so, studies have found that you know reintroducing copper can restore immune function responses. And so that's very promising from the type of data that by detecting specific deficiencies, we can better pinpoint

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Exactly sort of what an individual and need to restore health and restore healthy functioning of their immune system.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And. And what's also, in addition to sort of these key micronutrients that are essential for the functional immune system. We're also detecting widespread deficiencies in

14156370075: Factors that are integral for the

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Physical strength and integrity of our neuromuscular systems, including iron, magnesium, potassium and calcium and

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Yeah, these, these efficiencies are being like I said detected across

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Many other participants. And as we know, I'm just going is designated as a food doesn't mean that there's no accessible grocery stores markets or social services or lack of the services and so

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): This type of data allows us to sort of kind of help kind of connect the dots in terms of what what what we sort of see on the ground.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And sort of really kind of connects these toxic burdens environmental factors, plus this compounded effect of deficiencies and is essential nutrients that are critical for our healthy function or healthy

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Critical for health and

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): So with that first year and that preliminary data, we are seeking in this year to expand our efforts. And so we recently submitted a letter of intent, the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Got a call for Community Solutions for health equity and the vision with this grant is to expand this program to incorporate the full population of baby plant area and extensive 40,000 residents in the

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Code area and establish

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): A toxic register you for the community. And this registry would provide comprehensive medical on nutrient intake and evaluation and referral to specialty clinics as well as

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): advocacy for potential relocation or job the assignment for residents found to have toxic body burdens and associated sees

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And so funded it will allow us to continue these efforts.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And hire full time physician and by mental health educator and clinical epidemiologist and really sort of what we're hoping to build out in this registry is

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Kind of advanced our mapping of these factors with overlaid to existing mapping of the shipyard, and ideally cross reference these data with

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): The air monitoring data that could be an action is also carrying how through really kind of a last really

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Best Taylor remediation efforts and hopefully catch these exposures as extreme as we can.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And yeah, like I said, So allies to better identify the social and environmental determinants of health effects adversely impact the optimal functioning of the human human immune and or muscular system.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And this is by monitoring is really cutting edge science and so really would sort of raise the bar on

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Personalized medicine and expand this science and be able to provide high quality personalized treatment and optimization of of health and doing so in a simple, reliable, low cost and accessible way.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): At during right in the community. And so that's that's the vision through for this year and

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Yeah. We should be getting back about that grant hopefully by the end of the year.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And now it's that

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): please get in touch. If you have any other questions, and my email is listed there. And the clinic is located. I don't think it's cheap and available for walk in, as, as well as appointments by call. Now if you take any questions.

Dalila Adofo: I do see a question in the chat. Um, could you please say something about the UCSF animal colony. Why would workers there have high levels of toxic elements.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): And that's a question. And if I'm a fully honest, I would have to get back to you take to answer that, um, who asked, I'm happy to, to ask Dr. suit and tie it back to, um,

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Yeah, I mean I know like Dr. Soon, try. It's just strategically sort of inherent in this show pilots are to do weekly kind of like cross referencing areas with like knowns or of exposures and so there's certainly likely existing documentation of of

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Experiments or chemical runoffs that were known to serve have been us at the animal, Connie.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): As much you tell us. I know, for now, but I'm happy to do some more research and get back to whoever asked that question.

Dalila Adofo: Um, I think he's asking where's it located is baby.

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Like typical, it is, it isn't a baby.

Dalila Adofo: Oh, I was on mute. No, thank you, thank you for giving us a quick update and I'm

Dalila Adofo: I'll probably just email him. So the questions and

Aude Bouagnon (she/her/hers): Excited. So thanks a lot to learn.

Dalila Adofo: Okay. Okay, thank you. Um, and then next. Um, well, first of all, is there any more questions for

Dalila Adofo: Oh,

Dalila Adofo: Okay, great. Um, and then next we can also have a quick update

Dalila Adofo: That was requested within this meeting about the southeast water treatment plant.

Dalila Adofo: And Kristen. Go ahead.

Thank you.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Hello everyone I'm Christina SALTO lab. I'm the outreach liaison for the southeast treatment plan construction. I haven't

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Been here to present before. So I'm going to just kind of dive in and if there's any questions, happy to answer them afterwards.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): But just wanted to kind of first brief you on the status of the construction and then also touch on some points that I know are a concern for the community that we actively and kind of address how we actively monitor and comply with those those concerns and requirements.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): So the, the southeast treatment plan is the largest treatment plant in the city of which there are three and there are a variety of very large capital improvement projects, taking place to improve the treatment plan so it

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): It looks better. It

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Works better and it

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): smells better

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And so with that, you know, there is some long term construction that is happening and to improve the treatment plant and and

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Right now we're kind of at this point where a lot of the construction is going to really start ramping up so if

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): You're in the community. You'll definitely start to see an increase in truck traffic and things like that. But also, you know, since you are out there, being the eyes and ears of the community. We do appreciate any kind of feedback regarding our operate our construction.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And so, you know, once the facility is upgraded the the the plant will

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Will have you know better admission levels than if there was no no treatment plan.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): You know, because of course you know it's in the community that as a PC is really engaged in wanting to be a good neighbor and there are very clear commitments.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): The largest project that happen that is happening at the southeast treatment plant has undergone environmental review and we there's a variety of the

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Environmental Justice requirements that we fulfill

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): With that project. And so just briefly touch on the status of construction.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): You'll you know there's some projects at the trauma plant but then also a Jason thurs the, the new se community center that one. The, the community center is going to be completed first

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Which will be done in 2022 during summer time so that that's very, very exciting. It's just a vertical build so relatively a pretty pretty straightforward project.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And then there's two very large projects at the plant itself one being the head works where the water flow comes in and then the bio solid digesters where the solids are composted which are the big cylinders.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): So the big main projects on the biosolids project we are relocating the digesters further away from residence on the other side, near the train tracks. This will, you know, along with the improved technology that is being implemented with this project.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): You know, it will it will further reduce odors and it will reduce emissions in the air that are impacting the community.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And, you know, so I'm speaking on kind of twofold you know they're there are you know the the operations of the plant. Once it's it's done. So that's going to be improved. Once the plant is completed.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): But in the meantime, we have all this very, very disruptive construction and with construction. There are a variety of different impacts that I know the community is often monitoring I receive the Ivan alerts that come in and I

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): You know if anything that comes in and that is related to the treatment plan. I'm, make sure to flag that immediately for our construction crews

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): You know some of the alerts that I've seen come in are whether the the construction piles are covered, you know, smell concerns dust concerns and air quality.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): The SRP UC is very dedicated to not just meeting clean construction requirements but exceeding the clean construction requirements.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): The projects are of course regulated at the federal level at the state level and at the local level, the local level requirements are a lot more stringent than the state and the federal levels and being in a

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): A air pollutant exposure zone.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Specifically, San Francisco has some of the most strictest requirements in the nation. And so

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): We all

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Some of those. The, the medications and the things that we do are related to the like that the type of engines, we use on our equipment we use very new engines that have the highest the highest quality filter on them.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): In addition,

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Many of our vehicles use bio diesel to to further reduce and then also we have a very

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Comprehensive environmental team, which does training tracking. In fact, I did some environmental training this morning.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And and there's regular site wide inspections that take place.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): As, as mentioned in a pre in previous presentations. There's air quality monitoring that happens.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And and so with the air quality monitoring. That's another thing that I'm, you know, I work with environmental team to really monitor and communicate out to the public.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Regularly at this meeting. One of the members from Member from community benefit fits

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Sits in and listens and occasionally will relay some information about the air quality, and if it has any kind of accidents.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Lately, there's been a few of the particulate matter PM 10 experiences due to the air quality of the wildfires.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): But we are always monitoring it. If it's related to our project if we are creating any kind of just

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Things like that. We have a lot of measures in place to reduce dust. So it shouldn't be happening. But we very closely monitor that so

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Whenever a truck leaves the site. The they are the walk the tires are washed down and we have a street sweeper that regularly triggers the site. The in the streets to keep any dust.

14156370075: To a very minimum

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): I think there's a lot to kind of unpack there I'll kind of leave it there and open it up to questions. But I'm very committed to coming back and and and

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): With a few more members of the team. As I mentioned, I'm a, I'm a community liaison, but we have experts that that are more well versed on the environmental requirements but but I'd love to take your questions.

Dalila Adofo: There was a question in the chat. I'm asking, Where are the other two plants.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Oh yeah. Okay. So there's one on. It's our oceans died plant over on the west side it's right kind of nestled underneath the zoo. And then there's another facility which is our northpoint facility which is

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Nestled kind of in the Embarcadero. It's kind of hidden. It's a few streets back and largely underground, which is only utilized during our wet weather season. And it's kind of an overflow.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Of the treatment plants.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): But they're, they're more or less. It's gravity fed and so a lot of you know it's like a lot of the people and everything live on the east side of the city. And so all of the stuff from the east side goes to the

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): To the southeast treatment plant and then this, the people that live here over on the west side there flows, go to the west side treatment plant and

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): But, but, as we have a combined system. And so we also treat a storm water.

Dalila Adofo: Any other questions for Kristen.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And if there's no more questions, I would also love to hear if there's any ways that we can partner with you to better

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): educate the community on on on the work that we're doing, you know I'm always open to hearing of different types of meetings and ways that you you also are connected with the community so happy to, to, to present it other meetings.

Dalila Adofo: Stepping out of my facilitator role. Again, I know be magic.

Dalila Adofo: Has been usually the Tuesday before this meeting, actually.

Dalila Adofo: Yes, so that

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): And I will be. I'm actually coordinating and at the moment to do a presentation to be magic. Because as I mentioned the constructions right about to start getting to increase. So we're we're making our rounds to give updates.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): On all of the projects. Another thing I want you to be aware of is that there's a section of Gerald Avenue. That's between Rankin and Phelps Street.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): That will be closed come January, because the biosolids project, as I mentioned, it's a very large project. It's, it's one of the largest like west of the Mississippi

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): But since it's so large and it's on both sides of the plant because of safety reasons, because there's going to be large equipment from both sides. They're going to have to close that dirt for the duration of the project.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): But I can circulate the the flyer to you and you can share it.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): With a minutes

Dalila Adofo: Yeah, that'd be great. Thank you.

Dalila Adofo: All right, it is 350. Is there any last questions or comments.

Dalila Adofo: No.

Dalila Adofo: All right, well, um, the next meeting will be November 18 from five to seven again virtual um, again, thank you all for taking time out of your every third Wednesday to

Dalila Adofo: Be in this space. And if there's no last announcements or resources or anything like that, we can go ahead and turn the meeting.

Dalila Adofo: All right.

Dalila Adofo: Thank you.

Linda Cedillo-ED-CARB: Thank you.

Bye bye. Thank you.

Kristen Asato-Webb (She/Her/Hers): Thank you.

AAsinas: Thank you.